MELA NOTES
Journal of Middle Eastern Librarianship
Number 84 (2012)
ISSN 0364-2410
PUBLISHED BY THE MIDDLE EAST LIBRARIANS ASSOCIATION

EDITOR
Marlis J. Saleh
University of Chicago

REVIEW EDITOR
Rachel Simon
Princeton University

OFFICERS OF THE MIDDLE EAST LIBRARIANS ASSOCIATION
Christof Galli, Duke University President, 2012-2013
Michael Hopper, Harvard University Past-President, 2012–2013
Sean Swanick, McGill University Vice-Pres./Program Chair, 2012-2013
William Kopycki, Lib. of Congress, Cairo Sec.-Treasurer, 2010-2013
Marlis J. Saleh, University of Chicago Editor, 2010-2013
Anaïs Salamon, McGill University Webmaster, 2012-2015
Kristen Wilson MELANET-L List Manager, 2010-2013
Shayee Khanaka, UC Berkeley Member-at-large, 2012-2014
Sharon C. Smith, MIT Member-at-large, 2011-2013

MELA Notes is published once a year. It is distributed to members of the Association and subscribers. Membership dues of US $30.00 bring the Notes and other mailings. Subscriptions are US $30.00 per calendar year, or US $16.00 per issue for most back numbers.

Address correspondence regarding subscriptions, dues, or membership information to:
William Kopycki, Secretary-Treasurer MELA
Unit 64900 Box 26
APO AE 09839
United States of America

Address articles and other notices to:
Marlis J. Saleh
Editor, MELA Notes
University of Chicago Library
1100 East 57th Street
Chicago, IL 60637
E-mail: editor@mela.us
Phone: (773) 702-8425
Fax: (773) 753-0569

Address books for review to:
Rachel Simon
Catalog Division
Princeton Univ. Library
1 Washington Road
Princeton, NJ 08544
E-mail: rsimon@Princeton.EDU

http://www.mela.us/MELANotes/MELANotesIntro.html

Articles and reviews must be submitted in electronic format by email attachment or disk.
MELA NOTES
Number 85
2012

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

CONNIE LAMB
Selective Outsourcing: A Case Study of BYU’s Arabic Collection ................................................................. 1

ABDUL AHAD HANNAWI
The Role of the Arabs in the Introduction of Paper into Europe ........................................................................ 14

RIFAT BÁLÍ
The Turkish Book Publishing Market at the End of 2009 ........ 30

AMANDA CLICK
Issues of Plagiarism and Academic Integrity for Second-Language Students ......................................................... 44

CODY BEHLES

PAUL CREGO
An Annotated Bibliography of Periodical Literature Obtained in Abkhazia 6–11 June 2008 ........................................ 66
REVIEWS

BRUSTAD ET AL.: Alif Baa: Introduction to Arabic Letters and Sounds
(Gregory J. Bell) ........................................................................................................ 76

DAHLGREN: Contesting Realities: the Public Sphere and Morality in Southern Yemen
(Katherine Sydenham) .............................................................................................. 79

LIPPMAN: Arabian Knight: Colonel Bill Eddy USMC and the Rise of American Power in the Middle East
(Judy Alspach) ........................................................................................................... 81

ALTOMA: Iraq’s Modern Arabic Literature: A Guide to English Translations since 1950
(Akram Khabibullaev) ............................................................................................... 83

CHEKAYRI: An Introduction to Moroccan Arabic and Culture
(Anaïs Salamon) ......................................................................................................... 84

ARMES: Arab Filmmakers: A Dictionary
(David Giovacchini) ................................................................................................... 86

GALLEGO: Bibliography of Jews in the Islamic World
(Rachel Simon) ............................................................................................................ 89

WARD: Immortal: A Military History of Iran and Its Armed Forces
(Nancy Beygijanian) .................................................................................................... 92

Books Received for Review in MELA Notes ......................................................... 95

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Partington Award ..................................................................................................... 96

Atiyeh Award ............................................................................................................. 98
Atiyeh Award Essay .................................................................................................. 99

ANNUAL MEETING 2011

Minutes and Reports ............................................................................................... 102
Selective Outsourcing:  
A Case Study of BYU’s Arabic Collection

CONNIE LAMB  
BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY

Introduction
To outsource or not to outsource—that is the question. At least that is a question many libraries and cataloging departments have considered in recent years. Outsourcing is defined as “accessing expertise and resources from an external organization to supplement or take full responsibility for a function that was previously accomplished inhouse” (Dunkle 33). Outsourcing has been used by libraries for many years in the form of buying books with cards, ordering cards from LC, book approval plans, retro-conversion projects, and cataloging operations including authority records (Harken 67; Block 73; Marcum 19; Johnston 129). Outsourcing is a possible solution to heavy cataloging workloads, including backlogs, unfinished projects, reclassification, and other processes. In making decisions about outsourcing, the risks and advantages must be considered, and the decision-making process can be as simple as asking a few questions or as complex as using a matrix.

Selective outsourcing can be used to accomplish a specific task or to deal with a particular set of items for which a library does not have the expertise or resources to catalog, and according to Dunkle, it can provide an answer to the problems of catalog departments (abstract). Johnston states that, “I see outsourcing as particularly beneficial in completing specific activities or projects, rather than eliminating whole departments or libraries” (1996 128). This was the case for the Harold B. Lee Library at Brigham Young University (BYU) in dealing with a group of Arabic-language
books. In 2004, BYU contracted with a local vendor to reclassify and fully catalog about 450 Arabic books that had been skipped when the rest of the library collection was moved from Dewey into Library of Congress classification. This case study demonstrates how foreign-language items can be possible candidates for selective outsourcing of cataloging processes.

**Literature Review**

Literature research shows the variety of applications for outsourcing as well as how to go about deciding its use. A main target for outsourcing is cataloging and its various operations (see Abel-Kops, Anyomi, Cline, Jiang, and Libby). Literature reports range from outsourcing whole catalog departments (Wright State University—see Hirshon; Miller; Wilhoit; Winters) to the cataloging of particular formats or sections of material such as microforms, government documents (Stomberg), rare books (University of Dayton—see Tsui), Slavic language (Ohio State University—see El-Sherbini), and other foreign languages (Louisiana State University—see Brown) to book vendor cataloging (Stanford University—see Wilson) and copy cataloging (Adelphi University—see Horenstein, and Stanford University—see Wilson). Outsourcing of other library tasks includes authority control (University of Dayton—see Tsui, and University of Saskatchewan—see Lam), purchasing record sets (Banerjee), and book selection in Hawaii (Cline). Riverside County Public Library outsourced their entire library operations (Baker; Glick). Library literature includes books and articles on decision-making criteria and models, pros and cons, costs, what to outsource, vendor relations, and various outsourcing ventures as noted above. Bush et. al. discuss the capability of vendors to perform library functions such as collection development and acquisition in addition to cataloging, and Walker looks at the customer’s perspective.

Library literature contains little about outsourcing foreign-language material. The major contributor in this area is Magda El-Sherbini who wrote two articles about contract cataloging of Slavic-language books at Ohio State University. When the Slavic-language cataloger at Ohio State resigned, administrators decided to try a pilot project to outsource part of the Slavic backlog. The library was anxious to make the materials, which required original cataloging, available to researchers and scholars. When the staff evaluated the pilot project, they determined that the cataloging was cost effective
Selective Outsourcing

and of acceptable quality (see El-Sherbini 1995). In 2002, El-Sherbini published another article explaining that after six years of outsourcing, the library staff evaluated the process and determined that costs became lower in-house over time while vendor costs increased slightly. Also, with technology and data sharing contract cataloging became less attractive. El-Sherbini discusses the cost analysis and the advantages vs. disadvantages of outsourcing and in doing so, provides some useful guidelines.

Stanley Wilder of Louisiana State University makes the comment that with a small staff, his library cannot maintain foreign language expertise for the full range of materials they want to add to their collection. Possible solutions to this problem include centralized cataloging or commercial ventures (Brown 4). Hill suggests that if a library receives a small number of Arabic materials and has no resident expertise in the language, the only options may be continuous backlogs or outsourcing the cataloging of such books (118).

Decision-Making Criteria/Models

The decision of whether to outsource or not depends upon many factors and the criteria or models can range from simple to complex. In general, the library must consider its needs, goals, and capabilities. Is the need for a long-term strategy or a short-term tactical objective? Cost saving can be a major reason for outsourcing; however, other factors may override cost when making the decision. Other important considerations may be increased access to library material or a lack of staff resources or expertise. For those involved in making decisions about outsourcing, there exists in the literature extensive information on questions to ask and criteria to consider. Harken provides questions under the categories of why, who, what, when, how, and where, and emphasizes the importance of defining needs. Kascus and Hale edited a small book for the Association for Library Collections and Technical Services, published by ALA, which provides a checklist of considerations in outsourcing cataloging, authority work, and physical processing. These include such items as pre-outsourcing considerations, financial considerations, physical processing, and other relevant aspects. A book by Benaud and Bordeianu (1998) delves into the issues and outcomes of outsourcing in academic libraries, while Hirshon and
Winters developed a complete how-to-do-it manual for outsourcing library technical services published in 1996.

In addition to questions and checklists, some authors have developed models to assist in making the important decision of whether to outsource or not. A simple model is offered by Marcum (1998) which he calls a library outsourcing decision matrix. The vertical axis is a continuum that stresses the process. According to this model, “folklore” (erroneously labeled “background” in top box) refers to tradition (we’ve always done it that way), “mandated” are legal or governmental requirements, while “background”, “priority,” and “identity” refer to a specific library. Words on the horizontal axis signify relationships with partners, suppliers, and other stakeholders with the increasingly significant terms of “support,” “reliance,” “alignment,” and “alliance.” More marks on the left indicate that the library should probably process in-house, while a stronger showing to the right would encourage outsourcing (21). Ball (2003) discusses Marcum’s model and then proffers two of his own that take into greater account market and other conditions, as shown in the tables below. The simple one allows for no/yes checkmarks for aspects under cultural, economic, and functional categories as a way of determining suitable candidates for outsourcing or at least informing judgments and decision-making. The second is a weighted decision matrix that uses weighted numbers to provide additional insight especially for determining possible candidates for outsourcing (29).
Table II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peripheral to service identity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complies with corporate strategy(ies)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate policy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High revenue cost</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High capital cost</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market/suppliers exist</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to deliver service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor or declining performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to specify service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table III

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peripheral to service identity</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complies with corporate strategy(ies)</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate policy</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High revenue cost</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High capital cost</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market/suppliers exist</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to deliver service</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor or declining performance</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to specify service</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Again it is worth noting that this is not a prescription: we do not recommend the automatic outsourcing of services with, say, five out of nine ticks in the right-hand column. Rather, a profile of ticks to the right suggests a service as a suitable candidate for an outsourcing exercise.

Simple Matrix – Ball
Another tool for making decisions about outsourcing is given by Woodsworth and Williams. Their premise is that cost is the bottom line, so they provide a table that summarizes the degree of fiscal flexibility and amount of overhead commitments for several options. The goals and personnel must also be added to the equation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weight Factor</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 High capital cost</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Market/suppliers exist</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 High recurrent cost</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Compiles with corporate strategy(ies)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Poor or declining performance</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Easy to specify service</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Peripheral to service identity</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Corporate policy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Difficult to deliver service</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>51</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weight Factor</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 High capital cost</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Market/suppliers exist</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 High recurrent cost</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Compiles with corporate strategy(ies)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Poor or declining performance</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Easy to specify service</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Peripheral to service identity</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Corporate policy</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Difficult to deliver service</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>43</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Weighted Decision Matrix - Ball
Decision-makers have to consider the short-term impact as well as long-term implications of their decisions.

BYU Case Study
BYU spent minimal time in discussion about whether to outsource or not because the need for better access to Arabic material was recognized and money was available for this small project. About five years ago, BYU established a Middle East/Arabic major and because of this and current events, interest in the Middle East region and the Arabic language has increased substantially, creating the need for more vernacular material. The cataloger who works with these items knows some Arabic and hires a student with Arabic-language expertise, but they work only part-time on Arabic-language material. They are now, and have been for some time, working on a backlog of material along with new items received. Our interest was to make those books which were still on the shelf in Dewey classification, and with incomplete records, more accessible in a timely manner. So the decision was made to outsource that select group of books and in doing so, we learned much about the process. BYU outsourced to Backstage Library Works of Orem, Utah, and they worked from our catalog cards, which were incomplete. We conducted an inventory of the books and then Backstage staff came to the library to scan the cards, making an electronic version of the records. They fully cataloged the books, added subject headings when needed, and attached LC call numbers. BYU then loaded the records, did authority work, double-checked the records, and bar coded and labeled the books. The steps BYU Library went through, which could be a general outline for outsourcing, were: recognize a problem or need, consider internal resources and options for outsourcing, select a vendor, decide who will do what (both the library staff and the outsourcing company), have a sample set done to resolve any problems or questions, meet
with vendor representatives to discuss and plan, sign the contract, communicate regularly during the process, double check work as it progresses, and do any follow-up work.

Some of the challenges BYU library faced were: the need for teamwork among many players; varying expertise; dealing with different computer systems; determining who would do what; and communication. Backstage was very good with communications; the project director sent a weekly email to update BYU about the progress. The report included a statement on the project’s status, the next step, the promised delivery date and expected delivery date, and new/open issues. This communication, along with frequent emails and phone calls, was very helpful. The contract is a critical aspect of outsourcing. In theory the contract means that there will be no surprises. Not only does it include projected costs, it should also state the expectations and timeline. Another list is provided by Woodsworth (1993), who states that the aspects which contract negotiations need to cover include defining responsibilities, costs, and performance standards for the components of in-house operations (25).

At BYU several people and departments were involved in the planning, contract negotiation, pre-processing, and various decisions, including me, the Middle East Studies Librarian (public services), the chair of the cataloging department, the Arabic-language cataloger, a person from computer support, and an administrator who provided the money and signed the contract. Each person brought specific expertise and understanding to the group and we conducted many discussions prior to and after contacting Backstage. We selected Backstage because the same company under a different name had performed re-conversion work for us and they are local, which made contact easy. They asked us to complete a questionnaire that provided them with the parameters we desired. This
questionnaire showed what we expected them to do and what we would do in the processing of the books. It included the identification of types and numbers of items to be processed, fields to be added to the records, languages involved, and the source of the data. BYU indicated, through the questionnaire, that RLIN should be the utility to use for copy records, that SIRSI Unicorn is our automation system, and that the records would be uploaded to both RLIN and OCLC. The agreement was that Backstage would add LC subject headings where needed, correct typos, verify physical descriptions, and add LC call numbers, while BYU would do the authority work and physical processing.

Conclusion

Providing access to a particular resource may be a candidate for project-based outsourcing (Block 75). BYU’s decision to outsource a limited set of Arabic books for full cataloging and reclassification is an example of selective outsourcing. Foreign-language material is often a possibility for outsourcing, either as long term solution (if language expertise is not available in-house) or for specific, finite projects. The general considerations, steps, and challenges of outsourcing, as presented above, are similar for any type of library and type of project. The criteria and models are offered as aids in helping libraries make decisions about outsourcing. Although outsourcing requires time and effort in preparation for contracted work, selective outsourcing, if done well, can be beneficial to both libraries and their patrons.
Epilogue
Several years have passed now since BYU Library’s experience with outsourcing to Backstage. In retrospect, we feel that outsourcing was worth it, although there were some problems that came up afterwards—it was not all smooth sailing. The people at Backstage were good to work with and the project went well. However, since they were working from cards rather than the books, BYU catalogers had to review all records and make many revisions. It was labor intensive to prepare the cards and then to review and correct records after the outsourcing was completed. Cataloging in-house is usually less expensive for us, but the lack of language proficiency created a situation that made outsourcing the most viable option. Over the last few years, BYU has outsourced more Arabic and other foreign-language books such as Hindi, Punjabi, Turkish, and Farsi to TechPro (OCLC) with high quality results. In these cases, we sent the books, which eliminated the clean-up that was required with our first project. Also, when this cataloging is done, it is entered into the Worldcat database so it contributes to cooperative sharing. BYU Library still has backlogs and foreign language material that will make outsourcing a continuing option for us.
Bibliography


The Role of the Arabs in the Introduction of Paper into Europe

ABDUL AHAD HANNAWI
YALE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY

With the invention of writing several media were utilized to record language: potsherds, stones, bones of animals, bark of trees, leaves of plants (especially leaves of the palm tree), and hides, which included parchment prepared from the skins of goats and sheep and vellum prepared from the skins of calves. In some Middle Eastern traditions the best hides for writing manuscripts were those of the gazelle or deer. As late as the beginning of the seventh century C.E., during the lifetime of the Prophet Muhammad, it is related that the verses of the Quran were recorded on the readily available materials at the disposal of the Prophet’s scribes. Three substances in particular are mentioned: bones of camels’ shoulders, pieces of hide, and the leaves of palm trees.

As organized societies started to form, more specialized media for writing were developed. The Sumerians in southern Mesopotamia made clay tablets from the sedimentary earth deposited on the banks of the Tigris and the Euphrates on which they incised the cuneiform symbols of their language. They then baked the tablets or let them dry in the sun. Hundreds of thousands of such tablets have been unearthed and are still being dug out by archaeologists in different parts of the Middle East, on which are recorded in the cuneiform script and in different languages myths and events going back to the fourth millennium B.C.E. The Egyptians, on the other hand, manufactured writing sheets from the abundant papyrus reeds growing on the banks of the Nile and in the swamps of the Delta, on which they recorded the hieroglyphics of their language. The ancient historians recorded how the papyrus rolls were produced. A description of the process of papyrus manufacturing in ancient Egypt is given by Pliny the Elder, the Roman historian (23–79 C.E.), in his Natural History. The Latin text of Pliny’s description is reproduced with an English translation by Naphtali Lewis in his Papyrus in
The stalks of the papyrus plant were cut into narrow strips and placed together to form two layers, one horizontal and the other vertical. The two layers were then pressed against each other to form a white and durable sheet with a smooth and absorbent surface. Pliny thought that the adhesion of the two layers was due to the muddy substances in the water of the Nile, while in reality, the cells of the papyrus fibers were crushed and squeezed under pressure, extracting a glue-like substance which helped the fibers of the two layers to stick together. The individual sheets were then joined together by pounding their edges against each other. Thus, a flexible and continuous roll could be formed. We also find a description of how papyrus was manufactured in the book of the Arab herbalist Ibn al-Baytar (d. 1248 C.E.), Al-Jamiʿ li-Mufradat al-Adwiyah wa-al-Aghdhiyah (A compendium of simple drugs and foods). The papyrus roll usually consisted of twenty joined sheets (the average number of sheets produced from a single stalk of papyrus).

There is evidence that papyrus rolls were produced in Egypt as far back as 3000 B.C.E. The oldest extant papyrus is a blank roll discovered in an Egyptian tomb. The British Museum houses “The Great Harris Papyrus,” which is one of the largest papyrus rolls ever discovered, measuring 133 feet in length and 16.75 inches in breadth, and dating back to the year 2200 B.C.E. The Egyptians were able to produce sufficient writing material for their own use. They also used papyrus as a revenue-generating commodity; they restricted its selling and fixed its price by regulating its production at home, and sold the surplus to other regions. Papyrus production in ancient Egypt was a government monopoly. The word itself in the Egyptian

---

4 Lewis, Papyrus in Classical Antiquity, 84.
5 Dard Hunter, Papermaking: The History and Technique of an Ancient Craft (New York, 1943), 311.
language means “that of the Pharaoh.”⁶ The Ptolemies too considered papyrus a state monopoly and sometimes prohibited its exportation to certain regions. It was also considered so by the Romans.⁷ During Arab rule it is recorded that the caliph ʿAbd al-Malik in the year 690 C.E. imposed an embargo on the exportation of papyrus as a reprisal against the Byzantine emperor Justinian II Rhinotmetos (r. 685–695, 705–711).⁸ Egyptian papyrus, nevertheless, continued to be shipped to Europe until the beginning of the twelfth century, despite the fact that the manufacturing of real paper had already been known in Egypt since the year 900 C.E.⁹ However, by the ninth century Egyptian papyrus ceased to be the main medium for writing in Europe. “The Muslim conquest of Egypt in the seventh century and the collapse of the ancient commercial networks led to the gradual disappearance of papyrus and its replacement by parchment in the medieval West and Byzantium.”¹⁰

In the Far East, the situation was different. There is no evidence that Egyptian papyrus reached that region of the world; the Chinese used silk and linen cloth and brushes made from camel’s hair to paint the signs of their language.¹¹ The breakthrough came in the year 105 C.E., when the Chinese invented the art of manufacturing paper from the macerated fibers of vegetable plants in a cheap and efficient manner. Yet, this extraordinary invention was confined to the place of its birth for more than six centuries before starting its long and laborious journey toward the West.

It is very likely that the Chinese kept the manufacturing of paper both a state secret and a state monopoly, as it was originally invented by one of the high officials of the royal palace.¹² This might explain the long period (ca. 650 years) which this invention took to reach

---

⁶ *Oxford Classical Dictionary* [online resource]: “The Greeks called it byblos or biblos [with epsilon or iota] later papyrus … believed to be derived from p-n-pr-o ‘that of the Pharaoh,’ which suggests that its manufacture and marketing were a royal monopoly.”


⁸ Ibid., 90, 92.

⁹ Ibid., 92.


Samarkand in Central Asia, and then only through the divulgence of the secret by some Chinese prisoners of war who happened to be papermakers, in the year 751 C.E.\textsuperscript{13}

There is no record that the Chinese actually traded this commodity with other nations. A comparison of this state of affairs with Egyptian-made papyrus is worthy of notice. Although the production and sale of Egyptian papyrus were kept under strict government regulations and control, the governments in Egypt actually had nothing to fear, as papyrus was a plant indigenous to Egypt only. Thus, even if the secret of its manufacturing, which is much more elaborate than that of real paper, was known to other peoples they would not have been able to manufacture it themselves since they did not have the natural substance at their disposal, despite the fact that several attempts were undertaken to introduce it into other regions. As late as 836 C.E., for example, the Abbasid caliph al-Mu‘tasim imported papyrus makers from Egypt to his new capital, Samarra, north of Baghdad, to counteract the disruption of supplies caused by the frequent unrest in Egypt during that period. However, it seems that those attempts did not bear fruit.\textsuperscript{14} As for the Chinese invention, the case is different; the raw materials needed for the production of paper are available everywhere and the method of its production is not all that difficult to learn. Moreover, although the art of papermaking was introduced in the early seventh century into other Oriental regions, first into Korea (which at that time was part of China), and from there into Japan by some Buddhist monks, it actually remained confined to these isolated regions.\textsuperscript{15}

The year 751 C.E. constitutes a remarkable turning point in the history of paper; the lengthy journey of papermaking out of the Orient had started, and “the Arabs were the people destined to bring the Chinese invention of paper westwards.”\textsuperscript{16}

The Abbasids came to power in the year 750 C.E., after they had eliminated the first Arab dynasty, the Umayyads (who in turn were destined to re-establish themselves in southern Spain shortly thereafter and to introduce the art of papermaking into Europe). A

\textsuperscript{13} Ibid., 33.  
\textsuperscript{14} Lewis, \textit{Papyrus in Classical Antiquity}, 11.  
\textsuperscript{15} Hunter, \textit{Papermaking}, 27.  
year later, Abu Muslim al-Khurasani, the representative of the Abbasids in the province of Khorasan in northeastern Persia, commissioned the governor of Samarkand, Ziad ibn Salih, to subdue one of the Turkic tribes to the northeast. This tribe had allied itself with the Chinese, and subdued a neighboring tribe, thus bringing a large segment of the Turkestan region under Chinese hegemony. This state of affairs was not accepted by the ambitious ruler of Khorasan. It is worth mentioning here that the Arabs had already been in that region since the year 711 and had established themselves in Samarkand and other important cities of Turkestan since that date. The fierce battle that ensued on the bank of the river Tharaz is very well documented in both Arabic and Chinese sources. According to some sources the name of the battle was Atlakh near Talas. Clapperton quotes some Arabic and Chinese documents which give the exact date of the battle in the month of July of that year. The Chinese and their allies were defeated and pursued to the border of China. Some of the Chinese prisoners brought back to Samarkand were papermakers, and it was they who first established papermaking mills in Samarkand, and shortly thereafter in Khorasan. Thus, the Arabs were introduced to the art of papermaking.

It is probable that the Arabs had some access to Chinese-made paper some time in the seventh century or even earlier. It might have been brought from the East via the traditional land trade routes, or by sea carried by South Arabian merchants and seafarers. Clapperton states that the paper which was used in Mecca in the year 650, during the reign of the caliph ʿUmar, was imported from Samarkand. If this is true, then paper would have been brought to Samarkand from China or from some other Far Eastern region to be shipped westward. If, on the other hand, it was already being produced in Samarkand at that early date, then the story of its production being taught to the Arabs by the Chinese prisoners of war has to be interpreted otherwise, bearing in mind that the Arabs had already been in Samarkand and other Turkic cities of that region since the

---

19 Clapperton, Paper, 58.
20 Ibid., 8, 62.
year 711 C.E. However, scholars seem to be unable to agree on the date in which paper made its first appearance in Arabia. Hunter, e.g., states that the earliest use of paper in Mecca was in the year 707 C.E. and that it was brought there from China.\footnote{Hunter, \textit{Papermaking}, 315.}

In some of the early Chinese documents it is stated that the substances used in the manufacturing of paper are rags, tree bark, hemp waste, and fish nets.\footnote{Ibid., 24, 26.} However, in Samarkand the manufacturing of paper took a new twist, as the materials which started to be used in its manufacturing, namely flax and hemp, were very abundant and the water used very clear. According to Hunter the clearer the water the better the quality of the paper produced.\footnote{Ibid., 26.}

As is the case with most new inventions, it took some time before paper made according to the Chinese method was accepted in the departments of the government in Baghdad. Even fifty years after paper had been produced by the Muslims in Samarkand and Khorasan, the caliph Harun al-Rashid (786–809) was reluctant to allow paper to be used, let alone to be manufactured, in Baghdad. It was only at the beginning of the ninth century that the caliph “had ordered the use of paper as a writing material in the government offices because it was not possible to erase a text written on paper, or to scratch it out without this being noticed.”\footnote{Huart and Grohmann, \textit{“Kaghad,”} 419.} The caliph was finally persuaded by his grand vizier, Ja’far, and his brother Fadl (the governor of Khorasan), to allow the establishment of the first paper mill in Baghdad.\footnote{Clapperton, \textit{Paper}, 59.} It is worth mentioning here that the two brothers, Ja’far and Fadl, the sons of Yahya, belonged to the famous Barmaki family, one of the ancient aristocratic Zoroastrian clans. Its members had priestly and administrative roles during the Sassanid era. When the Abbasids came to power in the year 750 they appointed members of this family to the highest offices of their government, which they administered with an admirable competence. It is probable that Fadl came to know of paper mills firsthand during his term of office as governor of Khorasan (794–795), and realized their importance for both administration and finance. As a matter of fact, as a revenue-generating industry, papermaking had no less importance than the
two famous commodities of the ancient Mediterranean world, wine and olive oil. Soon after the establishment of the first paper mill by Fadl in the Dar al-Qazz “place of silk production” quarter of Baghdad several other mills were established, producing several kinds and qualities of paper, one of the best of which was named al-Ja‘fari after the grand vizier.26

Given the practicality of paper, the demand for this product increased drastically and in a very short period of time mills for the production of paper spread to other parts of the Islamic Empire. The third region to witness a paper mill was Tihama on the southwest coast of Arabia. Damascus was the fourth city to build paper mills and its paper, bearing its famous name “Charta Damascena,” was exported to Europe for several centuries.27 Other towns in Syria and Palestine—Tripoli, Hama, Manbij, and Tiberias—also had their own paper-producing factories.28 The paper mills soon found their way into Yemen and Egypt, where paper ultimately drove out papyrus, and according to a contemporary, in the tenth century it reached a high degree of fineness and polish.29 Another contemporary, while enumerating the exports of Egypt in the year 985/6, mentions paper but not papyrus.30

After it had reached Egypt, papermaking proceeded towards Morocco and from there it crossed the Strait of Gibraltar and landed in Spain. By the eleventh century papermaking had spread so extensively in the Islamic world that Clapperton suggests the question “Where was paper made?” would be better “Where was paper not made?”31

The Arabs had been in Spain since the beginning of the eighth century. After the Umayyads had established their rule there in the year 756, the cultural movement flourished so rapidly that it rivaled the efflorescent cultural and intellectual movement in Baghdad itself. Undoubtedly, the introduction of papermaking into Baghdad constituted a great incentive to the production of books, the expansion of knowledge, and the creation of new disciplines in all

26 Clapperton, Paper, 59, 60; Huart and Grohmann, “Kaghad,” 419.
27 Clapperton, Paper, 60.
28 Ibid.
29 Huart and Grohmann, “Kaghad,” 420; Clapperton, Paper, 60.
30 Ibid.
31 Clapperton, Paper, 61.
aspects of research and intellectual pursuits. It is no accident that with the accession of the caliph al-Maʿmun (813–833), son of Harun al-Rashid, less than two decades after the introduction of papermaking in Baghdad, a royal academy, Bayt al-Hikmah (The House of Wisdom), was established by al-Maʿmun in Baghdad. In that academy not only were the traditional Islamic sciences expounded, but also the knowledge, culture, and sciences of the Greeks, the Persians, the Indians, and the remnants of the ancient Semitic peoples were translated, studied, explored, and commented upon.\(^\text{32}\) Books were being produced by the thousands, and book dealers, authors, translators, calligraphers, and copyists all over the Islamic world achieved a considerable degree of prominence and fame. The famous essayist and prose writer al-Hariri (d. 1122), for example, authenticated in the last ten years of his life alone no less than 700 copies of his \textit{Maqamat}.\(^\text{33}\) The mid-tenth-century scholar and book dealer Ibn al-Nadim composed his bibliographical work \textit{Al-Fihrist} (Bibliographia), in which he lists, describes, and comments upon a large number of the books with which he used to deal (Ibn al-Nadim’s work has been edited and translated into English).\(^\text{34}\) It is not far-fetched to state that without the abundance of available and cheap writing material, such an undertaking would have been almost impossible to achieve.

Paper historians seem to agree that paper was known in Spain by the tenth century. Clapperton, for example, maintains that paper in Spain “was known since the beginning of the tenth century ... but it was probably not made there before the twelfth century. The center of the industry was Xativa [i.e., Shatibah] ... in the province of Valencia.”\(^\text{35}\) Hunter states in the “Chronology” of his book that the

\(^{35}\) Clapperton, \textit{Paper}, 63. Al-Himyari states in his \textit{Al-Rawd al-Mitar fi Khabar al-Aqtar} that “The paper of Xativa has no equal anywhere on earth and can be found everywhere, East and West” ([Beirut, 1975], 337). In a lecture at the MELA annual conference (Nov. 18, 2005, in Washington, DC) at the joint meeting program of MELA and the Africana Libraries Council, one of the lecturers mentioned that there are still several million unknown Arabic/Islamic manuscripts in Saharan and Sub-Saharan Africa.
year 950 witnessed the first use of paper in Spain.\textsuperscript{36} He also quotes the famous geographer of the court of the Normans in Sicily, al-Idrisi, who visited the city of Xativa in the year 1150 and reported: “Paper is there manufactured, such as cannot be found anywhere else in the civilized world, and is sent to the East and to the West.”\textsuperscript{37} Other paper historians maintain that paper “was locally produced from the eleventh century according to methods adopted by Maghribi craftsmen and was characterized by a zigzag mark that does not appear in paper made in the Muslim East.”\textsuperscript{38} In my judgment, the use of paper in Spain did not wait until the tenth century, nor did papermaking wait until the eleventh or the end of the twelfth century, to make their debut in that region. The cultural ties between Baghdad in the East and al-Andalus (Andalusia) in the West, were, despite the political rivalry between the rulers of the two regions, never severed. Books between East and West kept moving to and fro. Scholars, artist, jurists, and artisans kept coming into Spain, and were patronized and highly respected by the different emirs and officials of the courts. Less than two decades after the establishment of the first papermaking mill in Baghdad, the musician Zyryab (a pupil of Ishaq al-Mawsili, a dominant figure in the musical life of Baghdad during the reign of Harun al-Rashid and his son al-Ma’mun), when he reached Spain, “was so famous that the Emir personally went to meet him in Cordova in 822. In a short time he not only set the tone at court in music, but also pricked the Emir’s ambition to vie with his Baghdad rival.”\textsuperscript{39} The rival spoken of in this passage is no less a personality than al-Ma’mun himself, a dedicated patron of scholars and knowledge and the founder of the famous academy Bayt al-Hikmah. If the Andalusian emir himself traveled to meet and welcome an apprentice artist from Baghdad, it is incomprehensible that the Arab rulers of Spain would have ignored such a substance as paper, and such a vital invention as papermaking, an essential industry for the production of the very material by which culture

At the end of the lecture I asked: But from where did all the paper come? The answer was: Some came from the Maghrib, but mostly from Xativa.

\textsuperscript{36} Hunter, \textit{Papermaking}, 316.
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid., 319.
\textsuperscript{39} Brockelmann, \textit{History of the Islamic Peoples}, 184.
flourishes, while at the same time trying to rival their counterparts in Baghdad. To say that the news of papermaking could not have reached Spain by that time is indefensible, if we consider the movement of scholars, books, and merchants between the two regions. Moreover, contrary to what the Chinese did, the Arabs did not keep papermaking a state secret, nor did they restrict its manufacturing or regulate its production. It seems that paper remained a commodity on the free market, and its manufacturing a venture open to whoever wanted to set up a mill. As was mentioned earlier, paper factories spread very quickly into the different regions ruled by the Arabs, from Mesopotamia to Arabia, Syria, Palestine, Yemen, Egypt, and North Africa.

Although we do not have firm evidence, it is safe to deduce from the previous analogies and analysis that paper found its way into Spain soon after the start of its manufacturing in Baghdad, and that its production there was established by the middle of the ninth century. Once paper arrived in the Iberian peninsula the exposure of the European nations to it, and the art of its manufacture, should have been a matter of a few years. For although the Arabs occupied some of the regions of southern Spain, they did not shut themselves up in their cities. Their contacts with other parts of that region, through skirmishes, conquests and counter conquests, or alliances and trade, were continuous from the very beginning.

Moreover, if we are to accept the previously-stated hypothesis that paper and papermaking were already in Muslim Spain by the middle of the ninth century, it is not difficult to conclude that paper and papermaking would have been known to the Spaniards from that same period. Furthermore, if the Spaniards had access to the art of papermaking it would have been very easy for them to convey this knowledge to other regions in Europe. However, the question remains whether Europeans at that time were interested in this new material or not. There are some indications that Europeans during that period looked down at paper. Some paper historians maintain that “The early paper of Europe was regarded with disfavor, as not only was it higher in price and more fragile than parchment, but it was distrusted on account of its introduction by Jews and Arabs. A fanaticism drove the Christian world to condemn, and even destroy, everything that suggested the

40 Brockelmann, History of the Islamic Peoples, 181 ff.
Moslem civilization, although the European scribes no doubt knew that the newly introduced substance, paper, would eventually take the place of their cherished parchment.  

Whether some of the reasons given in this passage for the rejection of paper by the Europeans are valid or not does not negate the fact that Europe was reluctant at the beginning to adopt this new invention, similar to the reluctance of Harun al-Rashid in the East to replace the traditional writing materials with a new and untried substance. As was stated earlier, papyrus shipments to the West had come to an abrupt end, and the learned men of Europe had turned to the use of parchment by the beginning of the ninth century. Since then, the West had gotten accustomed to the use of parchment. Moreover, most of the works written on parchment were of a religious nature, and hence, acquired a considerable degree of sanctity. It is comprehensible that the monks would be reluctant to entrust their cherished works and efforts to a cheap and fragile new material. This argument applies not only to the contacts of Europeans with Muslims in Spain, but also to their contacts with the Eastern part of the Islamic world. In the East also, the contacts of the Arabs with Byzantium were almost continuous, despite wars, through trade and friendly embassies. Some of these early embassies were conducted between no lesser personalities than Harun al-Rashid and Charlemagne, the Holy Roman Emperor, with gifts exchanged between the two monarchs. There is also evidence that Constantinople, the Byzantine capital, used Muslim paper as early as the beginning of the tenth century.  

As the Europeans increased contacts with the Muslim world, both in the East and in the West, they began to savor the fruits of the Islamic civilization. In the case of paper and papermaking, it was only a matter of time before the Europeans realized that their cherished parchment was no rival to paper. In Spain, it is probable that the famous paper mills of Xativa fell into the hands of the Spaniards when James the Conqueror took Valencia in the year 1238. The paper mills of Xativa were mentioned by al-Idrisi, the  

---

41 Hunter, *Papermaking*, 34.
geographer of the Norman king Roger II of Sicily, when he visited that Andalusian city about a century earlier.\textsuperscript{44} It seems that a period of deterioration in the quality of paper of Xativa ensued with the fall of the city to the Spaniards.\textsuperscript{45} This is natural, as the skilled craftsmen of these mills might have fled before the city was taken, or might have opted to leave the province altogether. As we know from the history of papermaking in Europe, for one reason or another the Spaniards’ interest in paper manufacturing remained fairly limited, and most of the paper they consumed they had to import from abroad. It was the lot of another European nation, Italy, to develop this industry and carry it to new heights.

Another probable place for the introduction of paper into Europe was the island of Sicily. The Arabs started the conquest of Sicily by capturing the city of Palermo in the year 831 C.E. They ruled most of the land of Sicily for more than two hundred years, and their presence there did not come to an end with the Norman conquest of the island in 1060 C.E. The Normans “took over not merely the Arab system of administration, but also the basic elements of Islamic culture in intellectual life and in art.”\textsuperscript{46} About a century after the start of Norman rule in Sicily, the Arabic language and culture were still alive and the Muslim scholars still active, not only in their own circles, but also in the court of their Norman rulers. The Arab scholar and geographer al-Idrisi wrote his famous book on the geography of the known world in his days in Arabic for King Roger II (1101–1154).\textsuperscript{47} The Norman emperor Frederick II (1197–1250), about two centuries after the Norman conquest of Sicily, “cultivated this heritage in admiration of the science of the Arabs and their Greek teachers.”\textsuperscript{48} It is utterly incomprehensible that al-Idrisi, who visited Xativa (in Spain) and admired its famous paper mills only four years before the completion of his famous geographic work, would have taken the paper manufacturing industry lightly. After all, he was no stranger to the use of paper, and the Normans were not hostile to the

\textsuperscript{44} Clapperton, \textit{Paper}, 72.
\textsuperscript{45} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{46} Brockelmann, \textit{History of the Islamic Peoples}, 157.
arts and crafts of the Muslims of Sicily. By then, Sicily had become a flourishing cultural center and the Normans needed a cheap source of paper. Why rely, after all, on its importation from Spain? Moreover, it is very possible that paper mills in Sicily were already in existence when the Normans came in the middle of the eleventh century. If the hypothesis which was presented earlier, that paper mills were established in Muslim Spain by the middle of the ninth century, is correct, one cannot see any reason why the paper manufacturing industry would not have been carried over to Sicily by the same people who founded it in the Andalusian cities when they moved to the newly conquered island.

It is also possible that the production of paper in Sicily was the origin of the highly advanced papermaking industry that started a century or so later in the northern Italian city of Fabriano, and acquired world renown. According to some paper historians, the origin and the exact date of the Fabriano paper mills are not clear. Clapperton maintains that “the actual date of the birth of the industry at Fabriano, in the province of Ancona, still remains a mystery, nor is it known whence the knowledge of the art was carried there. Some historians say that it came from Sicily, others that it was brought from Palestine by the Crusaders.”

Another Italian center for the production of paper in the region of Genoa was established at the same time. Although the Genoese papermaking mills might have been established by returning Crusaders from the East, since they might have been contemporaneous with the Fabriano mills, there are indications that they might have been of Spanish origin, as “the Muslims lost ... their possessions in Corsica and Sardinia to the Genoese and the Pisans” toward the end of the tenth century.

Although the exact date of the first paper mill in Fabriano might not be known, nor its origin, paper historians maintain that by 1270 “paper of excellent quality was being made, and a large number of mills seem to have been firmly established for a good many years.”

Another paper historian states that the first mention of a Fabriano paper mill was the year 1276. The Fabriano paper industry had

49 Clapperton, Paper, 74.
51 Brockelmann, History of the Islamic Peoples, 163.
52 Clapperton, Paper, 74.
53 Hunter, Papermaking. 320.
developed so rapidly and became so powerful that “it was able to supply the needs of the whole of Europe, exporting large quantities to France, Germany, and Holland before these countries were able to make their own paper.”

It is very probable that the origin of the paper mills in northern Italy was indeed different from the Spanish tradition (or its probable offshoot, the Sicilian tradition). The vast distance that separates northern Italy from Sicily and the tradition that maintains that some monks established the first paper mill in Fabriano might indeed suggest a Middle Eastern, rather than a Spanish, origin. It is well known that the Crusaders started occupying some parts of Syria and Palestine at the end of the eleventh century and remained there for almost two hundred years. During their stay in the Middle East the Crusaders came into close contact with all aspects of life in that region. The paper industry, as was mentioned earlier, had already been established in the cities of the Middle East for more than 250 years when the Crusaders first appeared there. It is very possible that some of the Crusading monks learned the art of papermaking during their stay in the East, and upon returning back to Italy established the first paper mill in Fabriano. Even some craft-oriented pilgrims could have done so. The possibility of papermaking being carried to Europe by the Crusaders is suggested by what some authors have written about the origin of papermaking in France. In the “Chronology” at the end of his book, Hunter has the following to say concerning the year 1147: “According to legend Jean Montgolfier on the Second Crusade was taken prisoner by Saracens and forced to labor in a Damascus paper mill. He is supposed to have returned to France and in 1157 set up a papermaking establishment in Vidalon.”

Clapperton also mentions the story of the imprisoned Crusader who learned papermaking in Damascus and states that the first paper mill was established at Herault in southern France in the year 1189.

As we have seen, there are ample indications that papermaking had already started in some European cities by European citizens at least by the middle of the twelfth century. About a century later, we

---

54 Clapperton, Paper, 74.
55 Ibid.
56 Hunter, Papermaking, 319.
57 Clapperton, Paper, 83.
see the European papermaking tradition completely independent of any foreign influence and acquiring a separate identity and a momentum of its own. Moreover, while the art of papermaking in the East and in Muslim Spain and Sicily stopped developing and deteriorated until it was completely diminished and forgotten, the industrious craftsmen of Fabriano were rapidly developing the industry and lifting it to soaring heights: “In less than fifty years Italian paper acquired those qualities that would guarantee markets for its rapid expansion. The few countries that had exported paper until then were forced to fall back on their traditional outlets, and in time their industries were ruined.”  

Paper production in Italy was so well organized and immense that the Italians were able to satisfy the needs of all the nations of Europe before those nations started their own papermaking industries. The papermaking industry was patronized and protected by the ruling authorities from the early stages of its introduction into the cities of that country. Moreover, the papermakers had their own unions to protect their interests. Even more ironic, the nations of the Middle East, having forgotten the industry which they taught the Europeans a few centuries earlier, were completely dependent on the Italian papermakers for their own consumption. The reasons behind these rapid developments and “explosion” are worth exploring, and might be related to the social and political developments which were taking place in the Italian city-states and in other parts of the world at that time. But this is another story.

After it had established itself on European soil, and developed an independent tradition, the transfer of the art of papermaking to other European countries was inevitable. Gradually, the demand for paper in Europe tempted increasing numbers of the Fabriano paper craftsmen to establish paper mills abroad. “The departure of so many of the craftsmen became so serious towards the end of the 14th century that several decrees were passed prohibiting this emigration.”

Germany owes its first paper mill to a German merchant who brought the art from Fabriano to Nuremberg in the

---

59 Clapperton, Paper, 82.
61 Clapperton, Paper, 76.
In England, ironically, the first printing press had to wait about twenty years before it could use paper made in the first English paper mill. Movable type was introduced into England in the year 1476, and in the first three years of its establishment the Westminster printing press produced thirty books on paper imported from Holland. The first book to be printed in England making use of the paper produced in the first English paper mill (established in the year 1495, in Hertfordshire by John Tate) was completed in the year 1496.\textsuperscript{63}

\textsuperscript{62} Ibid., 94; Hunter, \textit{Papermaking}, 321.
\textsuperscript{63} Hunter, \textit{Papermaking}, 322–323.
The book market in Turkey is a fairly dynamic one and in recent years it has seen significant growth, both in the number of titles published and in the number of publishing houses.¹ This article, which was first presented during MELA’s 2010 yearly meeting, will attempt to provide an overview of the Turkish book market at the end of 2009.

The problem with evaluating the Turkish book market is mainly the lack of data. Basic data, such as publishers, turnover, reader profiles, and how the market is shared among various publishers, is all unavailable. Furthermore, the statistics of the ISBN Agency of Turkey, which represent the main data used in this analysis, are not detailed enough to permit an in-depth analysis of the market.

Therefore, the present study is based on data available and compiled from a variety of sources, such as the Turkish Statistical Institute (Ankara), the Association of Publishers (İstanbul), the Center of Higher Education (Ankara), the Center for Selection and Placement of Students to Universities (Ankara), the General Directorate of Higher Education of the Ministry of National Education (Ankara), and finally the ISBN Agency of Turkey (Ankara).

¹ This can be deduced from the number of publisher codes assigned. "Publisher code" is a number assigned by the ISBN Agency of Turkey to each publisher. In 2009, more than fifteen hundred (1,546) codes were assigned to publishers. As of end of May 2010, this number was 797. Regarding the number of titles, the statistics of the ISBN Agency of Turkey reveal that in 2008, there were 32,342 book titles published; in 2009, 31,286; and in 2010 (as of the end of May), 15,856 ISBN numbers were assigned.
BASIC DATA ON THE TURKISH BOOK MARKET

It is estimated that there are roughly one thousand bookstores in Turkey today. Since there is a flourishing market in pirated books, CDs, and DVDs,\(^2\) printers, publishers, and CD and DVD producers are obliged to obtain a certificate from the Ministry of Culture certifying that they are a printing house, a publisher, or a licensed CD or DVD producer. All published books have to bear a hologram sticker that is supplied by the Ministry of Culture. In order to obtain a hologram, an ISBN number has to be assigned by the ISBN Agency of Turkey. The distribution of books with no hologram is subject to a penalty of one to five years imprisonment, plus heavy fines.

---

\(^2\) According to the Istanbul Police, the number of pirated books confiscated up to 2004 was roughly 34,500. This number increased to 4.2 million in the period 2004–2009. The total market for pirated books, CDs, and DVDs is estimated to be around 2.5 billion dollars. (Source: Taha Akyol, “Korsan kitap 2.5 milyar $!” *Milliyet*, March 12, 2010.)

* As of the end of May 2010
Number of Publisher Codes Assigned (1987–2009)

* As of the end of May 2010
### Basic Data on the Republic of Turkey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>72,561,312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Universities</td>
<td>154 (102 State + 52 Private)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Public Libraries</td>
<td>1156 (2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of University Libraries</td>
<td>416 (2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of University Students</td>
<td>3,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Teaching Staff</td>
<td>105,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate Students: M.A. Degree</td>
<td>140,043</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate Students: Ph.D. Degree</td>
<td>44,768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Graduate Students</td>
<td>185,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate Students in Social Sciences</td>
<td>89,274</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Number of Titles for Which ISBNs Were Assigned in 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>No. of Titles</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Turkish Authors</td>
<td>25,587</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translations</td>
<td>4,964</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Number of Titles</strong></td>
<td><strong>30,551</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Editions (Translations and Turkish Authors)</td>
<td>22,630</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The above figures include legal, text, and children’s books. The estimated market share of textbooks is 45 to 60%. The estimated number of titles by Turkish authors, excluding textbooks and translations, is about 10,000 titles.

### Subjects and Number of Titles and Copies Published, Including Translations, Legal, Text, and Children’s Books

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>No. of Titles Published</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>No. of Copies Published (1,000)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences</td>
<td>11,965</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>56.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belles Lettres and Rhetoric</td>
<td>9,357</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Geography and History

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>No. of Titles</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geography and History</td>
<td>2,328</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>2,135</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>1,748</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy and Psychology</td>
<td>1,036</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fine Arts</td>
<td>906</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language and Linguistics</td>
<td>409</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
<td>395</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>13.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Sciences and Math</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30,556</strong></td>
<td>100%</td>
<td><strong>129.12</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Places of Publication**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>No. of Titles</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>İstanbul</td>
<td>18,321</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ankara</td>
<td>8,117</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İzmir</td>
<td>796</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Konya</td>
<td>636</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adana</td>
<td>354</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bursa</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest of Turkey</td>
<td>1,017</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eskişehir</td>
<td>158</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kocaeli</td>
<td>117</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kayseri</td>
<td>115</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erzurum</td>
<td>113</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trabzon</td>
<td>106</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antalya</td>
<td>98</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diyarbakır</td>
<td>96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Number of Publishers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Private Persons</td>
<td>1,114</td>
<td>72.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporations</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishers (Inc and LLCs)</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishers (Sole Proprietorships)</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Institutions</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundations</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipalities</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Institutions</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Educational Institutions</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chambers and Associations</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>1,547</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Geographical Distribution of Publishers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ankara</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Istanbul</td>
<td>452</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Izmir</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Publishers (Incs, LLCs, Sole Proprietorships) Only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>İstanbul</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ankara</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İzmir</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Konya</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>178</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Publisher</td>
<td>Total # of Titles</td>
<td>General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLCs and Incs.</td>
<td>21,249</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sole Proprietors</td>
<td>1,461</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporations</td>
<td>2,646</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Publishers</td>
<td>2,154</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Institutions</td>
<td>1,273</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Institutions</td>
<td>737</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chambers and Associations</td>
<td>449</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundations</td>
<td>444</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>419</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Educational Institutions</td>
<td>281</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipalities</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Languages of Publication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>No. of Titles</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Turkish</td>
<td>29,351</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>1,022</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>814</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>203</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurdish</td>
<td>196</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td>63</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>61</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azeri</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dutch</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albanian</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkmen</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polish</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romanian</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farsi</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgarian</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korean</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenian</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbo-Croatian</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>No. of Titles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatian</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hebrew</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungarian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norwegian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tatar</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thai</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>31,187</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**English-Language Publications Subject Distribution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>No. of Titles</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences</td>
<td>536</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belles Lettres and Rhetoric</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography and History</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language and Linguistics</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fine Arts</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Sciences and Math</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy and Psychology</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,022</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**E-BOOKS**

The e-book market, which began in early 2010, consists exclusively of the e-version of bestselling books by Turkish authors. Major publishing houses have put on sale e-versions of their more recent titles. To have access to older titles seems to be more difficult, as they were not paginated in such a way as to be compatible with the
current e-book format. The market for exclusively e-books, which are not available in printed form, is at present very small. In 2008 the total number of titles was 107. In 2009 this increased to 146, of which 129 were Turkish works and 17 were translations.

**Places of Publication of Exclusively E-Books**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2008</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ankara</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İstanbul</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muğla</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edirne</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eskişehir</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kocaeli</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trabzon</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eskişehir</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amasya</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adana</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>146</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**E-Book Publishers**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publishers</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2008</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chambers/Associations</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Institutions</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Persons</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishing Houses</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Institutions</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundations</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporations</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DIFFICULTIES IN ACQUISITION AND CATALOGING

The main problem encountered is with the acquisition of grey literature. The definition of “grey literature” in the Turkish context is extremely wide. The first of many problems is the non-visibility of such publications. As the books are not offered through normal trade channels, it is an impossible task to fully ascertain what is being published by whom, where, and when.

Grey Literature Versus Trade Market

The total number of first editions produced by publishing houses (limited liability, sole proprietorship, and incorporated ones) is 22,710. This means that 73% of all titles for which ISBNs were assigned are available through trade channels. The remaining 27% (8,574 titles) are not available through trade channels and can be considered “grey literature.” Their publishers are NGOs, municipalities, provinces, government agencies, universities, self publishers, corporations and banks, political parties, ministries, chambers and associations, and finally the publications of the “Istanbul: 2010 European Capital of Culture” Agency.

Regular Trade Market

Regarding the regular trade market, the problems of acquisition are especially acute as it is filled with small, start-up and print-on-demand publishers, due to an inefficient distribution network and a short lifecycle for start-up publishers. Another problem is with titles that are published several times by different publishers within a certain number of years. The problem in this case is that the Catalogue-in-Publication data indicated in the latest edition of such repeatedly published titles list them as “first edition” without any indication whatsoever on the previously published editions.

CONCLUSION

Marketplace

In the Turkish book market Istanbul is the number one marketplace and the number two is Ankara. 44% of the publishing houses (79 houses) are sole proprietorships (SPs) while the remaining 56% (99
houses) are limited liability (LLCs) or incorporated companies. Only a handful of publishers have a strong organization.

**Bestselling Titles and Print Runs**
First editions of fiction titles, when the authors are well-known or celebrities, have a minimum print run of 10,000, and a maximum reaching upward to 50,000, 100,000, and sometimes even 150,000 copies. First editions of non-fiction titles have on average a run of 1,000 copies. Non-fiction best selling titles mainly deal with “current issues.” This subject category includes issues that have for decades been discussed in the Turkish political arena and which are the bread and butter of the Turkish media, such as conspiracy theories of all sorts, the Kurdish nationalist and separatist movement (PKK), whether or not to ban women with headscarves as civil servants in public positions and permitting them to study at the universities, whether or not a “deep state” actually exists in Turkey, etc.

**Promotional and Marketing Tools**
In view of the very high number of publishing houses and titles within a relatively small market, the competition is truly ferocious among the publishers, who are struggling to have first-row visibility for their titles in the market place. Among the promotional methods used the following are the most coveted:

a. lengthy interviews with the authors in the mainstream media (TV and press).

b. book signing events at bookstores and university campuses

c. book fairs in various cities (İstanbul, Ankara, Bursa, Adana, İzmir, Gaziantep, Diyarbakır, etc.).

d. product placement in Turkish television series; popular television series, such as *Valley of Wolves: Kurtlar Vadisi* and *Ezel*, are two examples in which the characters are shown reading the books in question. Such product placement tactics have an immediate effect on the titles that are read by the various characters of the series and sales inevitably boom in response.

e. laudatory articles by columnists of the Turkish press.

f. billboards and advertisements in the Turkish media.
Issues of Plagiarism and Academic Integrity for Second-Language Students

AMANDA CLICK
UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA AT CHAPEL HILL

Introduction
Initially, this literature review was intended to focus on issues of academic integrity in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA). I soon discovered, however, that this literature simply does not exist, at least not in English publications. Perhaps it does not exist in Arabic either. In one of the most recent monographs published about global librarianship, ur-Rehman notes that most faculty members in the MENA region “are not active in research and publishing, producing little in English and Arabic” (2009, 419). Whatever the reason for this lack of literature, the focus of this review changed to include second-language students, regardless of country of origin, language spoken, or where they might be pursuing higher education. All these students, undergraduate and graduate, do have one thing in common: they are all enrolled in English-language institutions and thus are attempting to earn a degree in a language that might be their second, third, or even fourth.

Many of these sources are about international students studying in Europe and North America, although some are about students in their home countries studying at an English-speaking university. American-style colleges and universities are scattered all over the world, serving local populations of students. These students often grapple with issues of academic integrity, and plagiarism in particular. I am not claiming that international or second-language students are less ethical than English-speaking students; simply that dealing with issues of academic integrity may be more complex for these students. It is these complexities, and even larger problems with the concept of plagiarism, that I intend to discuss in this literature review.

The Oxford English Dictionary defines plagiarism as “the action or practice of taking someone else’s work, idea, etc., and passing it
off as one’s own” (n.d.). In practice, however, the concept is more complicated. When a writer commits this act, taking language or ideas from a source without appropriate attribution, it is called textual plagiarism. When a writer does this purposefully, and with the intention to deceive, it is prototypical plagiarism (Pecorari 2003, 318). The acknowledgement of these two forms indicates that it is indeed possible for students to plagiarize unintentionally as well as intentionally. Duff, Rogers, and Harris note that “it is overly simplistic to distill all acts of plagiarism into deliberate acts of dishonesty” (2006, 680).

Plagiarism, textual or prototypical, is sometimes a new concept for college students. Those who learned something about it in high school often do not have a clear understanding of what plagiarism really means and how the practice or avoidance of it can affect their academic lives. These students might not comprehend the positive reasons for using techniques to avoid it, or see proper citation more in terms of “academic etiquette and polite behavior,” as opposed to “intellectual theft” (Ashworth and Bannister 1997). For second-language students, the concept of plagiarism may be brand new, and may be particularly confusing if it does not fit into a familiar cultural context or style of education. Amsberry notes that non-native English speakers may copy text for many reasons, including “differing cultural attitudes about text ownership, educational practices that encourage copying as a learning strategy, and linguistic challenges that lead to difficulties in understanding text as well as in expressing the writer’s idea” (2009, 37).

**Problems with Plagiarism**

Before delving into the struggles that both native and non-native English speakers have with plagiarism, it is important to discuss the issues that academics and educators have identified with the concept itself. First, plagiarism has been oversimplified by professors, universities, academic integrity councils, and many others. Yes, the concept can be quickly defined as the stealing of another’s ideas, but it is just not that simple. Currie, who spent a semester conducting weekly interviews with a second-language writer as she toiled to produce acceptable academic writing, notes that the “traditional and oversimplified view of plagiarism [fails] to account for the layers, complexities, and ambiguities embedded in the production of text”
Where is the line between inspiration and theft? Is there truly “nothing new under the sun”? 

Secondly, plagiarism is just not that easy to identify. For example, I just used the phrase “nothing new under the sun” without a citation, because I consider it to be a known idiom and thus categorized under common knowledge. But this phrase might not be considered common knowledge by a Korean undergraduate or a professor grading literature reviews. There are many guidelines to be interpreted for identifying plagiarism, and few clear rules. Because plagiarism is not so easily identifiable, and because it is often considered an issue of honor, it is also difficult to approach objectively (Pennycook, 1994, 278). Passing judgment on plagiarizers, a task assigned to professors, administrators and honor councils, is no easy task.

Finally, and most relevant to this review of the literature, the academy’s attitude towards plagiarism “unjustifiably elevates a Western concept to the status of norm” (Currie 1998, 1). Our current conceptions of authorship and text ownership are Western and have not always been in vogue; these are modern ideas (Pennycook 1996). Globally, the West may play the biggest role in advancing academia, but this does not mean that Western ideas of scholarship are the only or best ideas.

Non-Native English Speakers/International Students

Non-native English speakers (NNES) plagiarize, intentionally or unintentionally, for a variety of reasons. Some of these reasons are shared by all types of college students (e.g., poor time management skills), but some are specific to NNES (e.g., varying levels of English proficiency). Hayes and Introna conducted a study in which they interviewed students in a Master’s program in the United Kingdom; their focus groups included students from 13 different countries, including India, Pakistan, Indonesia, Thailand, Greece, Brazil, and more. They found that unintentional plagiarism was often linked to a student’s research process. For example, students take notes as they research, sometimes writing down text exactly as it appeared in the original source. When they use these notes to write a paper, students might use these exact phrases, not remembering these chunks of text are “not in their own words.” Duff, Rogers, and Harris find that unintentional plagiarism often “occurs unknowingly and is usually linked to ignorance or lack of skill with the mechanics of
Students in this study also expressed confusion with why they would change the words of an author who has already stated an idea so well, and claimed that there are “only so many ways that issues could be written” (Hayes and Introna 2005, 221).

NNES may copy text because it saves time, helps them acquire the necessary new vocabulary, and keeps them out of trouble and able to pass a course. For these students, “copying reflects less an intentional violation of cultural code than a survival measure in the face of perceived difficulties or deficiencies” (Currie 1998, 2). In an English-speaking institution, NNES are asked to produce academic writing in a language in which they may be barely fluent. Often their “heavy reliance on copying seemed to stem not from a conceptual misunderstanding, but rather from a lack of familiarity with academic writing,” according to Amsberry (2009, 36). Pennycook notes that these students lack confidence, because they feel that they have no ownership over the English language (1996).

Patchwriting is a technique often used by students, NNES and native English-speaking students alike, who have difficulty creating acceptable academic writing and/or comprehending the texts they are using as sources. It involves “writing passages that are not copied exactly but that have nevertheless been borrowed from another source, with some changes” (Howard 1995, 799). In other words, students select a relevant section of text from a source, and rearrange sentences, remove some phrases, choose replacement synonyms, etc. To use this technique is to commit plagiarism, but some scholars have called for a different view of this practice. Some view patchwriting as a crucial stage of learning to write in a scholarly manner, and an indication that the writer understands the source. Pecorari calls this “source-dependent composition,” which is used by students as they “learn to write in a new discourse, and that causes them to depend heavily on the language of their sources” (2003, 266). According to Hayes, patchwriting “implies a serious attempt to make sense of, and engage with, the material,” and should be viewed as part of the learning process (2005, 226).

**Non-Western Styles of Education**

This literature review has touched on several cultural issues that affect NNES students’ perspectives on plagiarism, and alternative education styles may be the most relevant. While Western-style
education. Values creativity, critical thinking, and research, the education system in many Asian and Arab cultures focuses on the memorization of texts and lecture notes (Aman 1994; Deckert 1993; Pennycook 1996). It is essential that educators do not think of these styles of education as inferior or backwards, but simply as alternative and different. In these systems fact is vital and analysis is secondary, if considered to be of relevance at all. The Western concept of research is unfamiliar, and Badke notes that these students may adhere to the “philosophy that research is essentially the reproduction of the work of others” (2002, 63).

Certain aspects of Western-style higher education may be more difficult than others for students who have spent most of their lives in a different style. For example, Chinese students may have difficulty writing an essay in which they must defend a position, because they may be accustomed to an education system that “does not typically require students to take a stance, but rather to find a way to harmonize the various alternatives” (Currie 1998, 6). Conducting and writing a literature review can also be a daunting task, because it is “heavily reliant on the students’ ability to be critical both of the quality and integrity of both research and author(s)” (Duff, Rogers, and Harris 2006, 687). Students who have spent most of their educational career considering textbooks (and their professors) to be the ultimate authority may falter when asked to critique the ideas of an expert. In a case study at the University of Alberta, librarians found that international NNES students placed the highest value on information given to them by professors and other figures of authority. They used these materials to identify the most important authors, and then searched for other papers by those authors (Morrissey and Given 2006, 233).

Ideas about knowledge vary a great deal across cultures. As previously mentioned, ideas about what constitutes “common knowledge” is different from person to person, and certainly from culture to culture. Talpos conducted a survey of faculty in eight different countries, asking them if they thought a sentence stating the population of China required citation. Although 47% of respondents believed citation to be necessary, none of the respondents from China, India, or Taiwan agreed (2007). Categorizing a piece of information is highly subjective. Some cultures tend more towards collectivism than does the typical Western society, and often authorship is less important because “information is shared and is
believed to be owned by the whole society” (Mundava and Chaudhuri 2007, 171).

**What Librarians and Other Educators Can Do**

Sometimes the responsibility for teaching students, be they native or non-native English speakers, local or international, undergraduate or graduate, is passed around an institution like a hot potato. This is an area, however, that librarians are uniquely positioned to address, although a concerted effort must be made to fully appreciate what NNES students really need. Librarians often assume that these students, as their English improves, can be made information literate in the same way the native students can be. But these students face unique challenges and may need guidance in the broader area of “academic literacy” (Badke 2002, 60). They have more to learn than how to conduct research and use sources—they need to learn about reading sources critically, writing in a scholarly style, interacting with professors, and more.

Librarians can incorporate plagiarism awareness into standard library instruction sessions, orientations, online tutorials, and workshops. Special sessions for international students may be appropriate for many institutions. It is important to ensure that students understand the consequences of plagiarism, and to “give appropriate instruction to help them learn to synthesize material” (Currie 1998, 12). Education about plagiarism and academic integrity should be a cross-campus initiative, and collaboration between departments can be most effective. At the University of South Australia, the School of Engineering worked with the university’s campus learning advisers to provide weekly workshops for international students in order to help them acclimate to the world of Western scholarship. Topics included avoiding plagiarism, citations, and selecting and using sources. Students also wrote a literature review and participated in a weekly Writers’ Circle. In the three years since this program was implemented, instances of plagiarism dropped from 50% among the international students to 5% (Duff, Rogers, and Harris 2006, 680).

Libraries can also provide a comprehensive definition of plagiarism, as many definitions provided by institutions are too vague or unclear. This should include examples of appropriate and inappropriate use of texts, and “should acknowledge that there is not necessarily a universal view of plagiarism and discuss why avoiding
plagiarism is important within the academic tradition of the particular institution” (Amsberry 2009, 39). This type of information would be beneficial for all students; as discussed earlier, many college students are confused about what exactly plagiarism entails, not just NNES students. Also, reference librarians can guide students to “sources that may be more linguistically accessible” (Amsberry 2009, 40) for students with varying levels of English proficiency, and at different stages in the research process.

Some scholars assert that campus-wide policies and views of academic integrity must be adjusted. Howard proposes that new policies on plagiarism should be implemented that account for the collaborative nature of writing, acknowledge the intent of the author, and respond positively to patchwriting (1995, 798). Certainly these policies would vary by institution, but the underlying theme of rethinking these concepts is omnipresent.

Efforts by the library and librarians to assist NNES students with “academic literacy” should be two-fold: they should “foster an engagement with academic scholarship (on the part of the students) and a deeper understanding of cross-cultural needs of students (on the part of the teaching staff)” (Duff, Rogers, and Harris 2006, 676).

**Conclusion**

The statistics on academic dishonesty abound. In a study on internet plagiarism in which 700 students from nine colleges were surveyed, Scanlon and Neumann discovered that 30% copied some text without citation sometimes or very frequently (2002). Students at schools with honor codes are less likely to rationalize or justify cheating than students at a non-code school. (McCabe, Trevino, and Butterfield 1999). Female students are more likely to be deterred from cheating by institution academic integrity policies (Hendershott, Drinan, and Cross 1999). But what do these findings really tell us? How can this information lead to better education for students, both local and international? The answer: Not a great deal, unfortunately. Professors and librarians are already aware that academic dishonesty is a problem, and thus more numbers reinforcing what is known are not necessary. The most important literature is that which supports thinking about these issues in new ways, and addressing academic dishonesty in a more appropriate manner.

Alastair Pennycook, a professor who has taught all over the world and published extensively on plagiarism and non-native
English-speaking students, makes several excellent points. He clearly articulates some of the problems with the way that many in academia view plagiarism. First, he points out that often publications that are identified as the result of original academic work actually depend on what he calls the “silent work” of others, including women (more so in the past), graduate students, and research assistants (Pennycook 1996, 213). Who can identify with certainty where each idea in a paper or book originally developed? In fact, Pennycook often notes at the beginning of his writings that the ideas included are the result of conversations with many colleagues, and cannot be solely attributed to any one person.

Most importantly, issues of plagiarism and other forms of academic dishonesty should be approached thoughtfully by educators. Certainly students, whether native or non-native speakers of English, must learn to successfully and ethically navigate the Western education system, should this be where they choose to learn. However, as this review of the literature has established, the exact definition of plagiarism is often vague and open to interpretation. As Pennycook states, “plagiarism needs to be understood within the particular cultural and historical context of its development, but it also needs to be understood relative to alternative cultural practices” (1996, 218). It is crucial that librarians keep this in mind as they assist students with developing acceptable writing and citing habits, and help them to understand why these practices are important.
Works Cited


The rapid political developments in Kyrgyzstan during the last decade have led to the production of a wide body of literature from a number of sources. Many of the publications designed to focus on the issue of political development of the state have either failed to provide sufficient details or have taken a stance which does not give a level analysis of the developments in the region. The former occurs most often in journalistic endeavors and the latter is most blatant in the Russian and Kyrgyz sources, but there is certainly not a uniform and measured opinion among English-language sources either. In order for Western scholarship to accurately analyze the political developments of Kyrgyzstan it is necessary to have an accurate synthesis of the articles available. This article, rather than focusing on the specific revolutionary periods or political issues, is designed to offer sources which analyze the broad political trends developing in the country and the role which identity construction has played in their development.

The sources which have been included are not limited by the original language of the work or the country of origin and the annotations which have been made for translated sources are based on the English translations rather than the original work. In order to create the best overview of the subject of political and identity construction in Kyrgyzstan during the period from 2001 to 2011, the sources cited will be largely academic peer-reviewed articles, book chapters, and single volumes published in English on identity construction and political developments during the last decade. While constrained chronologically to the period between 2001 and 2011, this bibliography has not approached source organization with
a focus on temporality or specific events. Such an approach, while useful in many respects, limits the readers ability to see wider trends. It would certainly be possible to produce a bibliography focused on the Tulip Revolution of 2005 or the 2010 revolution, but doing so without contextualization causes misinterpretation and leads to hackneyed journalism making sweeping generalizations about the politics of Central Asia without recognizing the inherent differences in each republic’s situation. Conversely, such an approach can also create a complete disassociation of political events from the arena in which they occur. This bibliography seeks to prevent this by including sources which create a cross-section of the major issues while also seeking to trace the development of these issues throughout the decade.

The second reason for the time period approach lies in the nature of post-Soviet Central Asian politics. The neopatrimonial political structures in place and the unusually long terms of the region’s presidents must be taken into account. Major events such as revolutions are important in that they mark a turning point in the political atmosphere, but equally important is developing an understanding of why the shift occurs and what the transitions demarcate. Kyrgyzstan's unique ability among the Central Asian states to remove its presidents from office through revolution cannot be explained by only examining the revolutions themselves. Thus examining sources from throughout the decade helps to explain the development and contextualize the unique political nature of the republic. The start date of 2001 is based on the significant increase in interest in the region due to the war in Afghanistan. The monolithic nature of Akaev’s presidency from 1991–2005 means that any earlier start date would not provide more pertinent data, only a greater number of sources to search through.

The methodology used in source collection was based on academic database searches available through the facilities at Indiana University. The databases that proved most fruitful in the search were EBSCO’s Academic Search Premier, Web of Knowledge, East View, JSTOR, and the ProQuest Dissertation search engine. These search engines all run on Boolean operating phrase systems and the search terms used during the research were uniformly maintained across all engines. Terms used in combination with the operating limiter phrase “AND” most often included:

These terms were used in combined phrases of two to three terms in the fields of general keyword, title, and abstract across the engines listed. In addition to these, it proved useful for the topic of this bibliography to employ the limiter phrase “NOT” to terms which addressed international political events and actors beyond Central Asia. The most effective was barring the term “United States” from title and abstract searches combined with one or more of the terms listed above. It should also be noted that the use of the limiter NEAR (when available) proved particularly effective when combining non-region-specific topical terms such as identity with proper nouns related to Kyrgyzstan. Beyond these search term limiters, the publication date range was set to 2001–2011 and the returns were limited to peer-reviewed works. Dissertations form the ProQuest engine were used to find articles in citation as well as alternative peer-reviewed works by the authors of the dissertations.

The format of the bibliography is categorically divided into topics as they relate to identity development in Kyrgyzstan. A schema of four categories representing a classification of sources was created inductively based on the subject matter of the chosen articles. The selected sources seek to create a cross section of identity politics from multiple vantage points.

It is the job of the sources selected to outline in detail the history and trends which have developed in Kyrgyzstan over the last decade, but it is pertinent to include here a brief outline of the historical events which have played a significant role in the state to help situate readers who are new to this particular field of study. Following the fall of the Soviet Union in 1991, Kyrgyzstan gained its independence. Having been economically and politically dependent on the Soviet system, independence caused severe setbacks in development for Kyrgyzstan, due in part to an absence of natural resource reserves. This, combined with the withdrawal of Soviet resources and manufacturing, led to a severe economic retraction. Adding to the difficulty of the situation was the presence (like everywhere else in Central Asia) of a neopatrimonial presidential structure which placed Askar Akayev in the primary position of power from 1990 to 2005. In 2005, following the Tulip Revolution, Akayev became the first Central Asian dictator to be removed from
power. He was replaced by Kurmanbek Bakiev, who was himself displaced in the uprising of March 2010. The current president, Almaz Atambayev, was elected in October 2011 after the post-revolution interim presidency of Rosa Otunbayeva. The complicated nature of presidential power in Kyrgyzstan is discussed in the articles which follow.

A second major issue of which the reader should be aware is the role of ethnic identity and nationalism in the state. The attempt to create a national ethnic Kyrgyz identity when there is arguably little historical precedence for such a concept is rooted in a number of different problems facing the state. One of the most pressing is the large Uzbek minority centered in Osh and the creation of a perceived North-South divide. The Kyrgyz state under both Akayev and Bakiev perceived the Uzbek population as a threat to national solidarity. The independence-period policy of creating a Kyrgyz national identity has been based in part on this relationship. There are of course many other elements contributing to the development of political structures and identity in Kyrgyzstan during the last ten years and this summary only hits those points which the reader should be aware of before beginning the readings or conducting further research on the topic.

The goal of this bibliography is to help the reader better understand the development of political structures in Kyrgyzstan during the last decade and the role of identity and identity construction in national politics. The tumultuous nature of the region and the often confounding media coverage during the revolutionary periods has left a great deal of ambiguity for anyone not deeply involved in the scholarship on the region. The selections here are meant to represent the best attempts to cover the development of major trends and to contextualize events in the country so that future scholarship might be able to more effectively include Kyrgyzstan in comparative discussions and analyses. It should of course be mentioned that because of the relatively recent nature of the conflict there is still a great deal of scholarship being written on the period in question and a great deal more to be researched. However, the sources included here will offer a strong base to any scholar interested in developing his or her own research on modern Kyrgyz political topics. By synthesizing the data already published for scholars in the field, this bibliography will help alleviate some of the initial legwork and help move future research along more quickly.
Identity and Social Issues
When discussing the nature of identity construction in Kyrgyzstan during the last decade it is important to give adequate attention to all conceptions of identity, not merely those which drive the political narrative of the state and scholarship. The role of non-ethnic identity in the representation of the Kyrgyz and in the comprehension of the topic more generally is imperative. The following articles represent a cross-section of academic sources which seek to address non-ethnic minorities in Kyrgyzstan and the challenges that these groups incur in the face of a nationalizing state policy with a particular vision for the identity of the people living within the state.

http://www.springerlink.com/content/p63g285m854548v2/

http://eprints.aston.ac.uk/1416/1/Amsler_Promising_Futures_2009_Post-publication.pdf

This essay discusses reform to higher education in Kyrgyzstan, focusing on the relationship between higher education and Kyrgyz politics in the post-Soviet era. The author then goes on to analyze the relationship between Kyrgyz education and the political ideologies of Marxism-Leninism and neoliberal capitalism.


Couched in the feminist paradigm, the article discusses the role of bride kidnapping in Kyrgyzstan during the post-Soviet period. The article highlights the element of gender in the creation of ethnic identity and how this practice helps to perpetuate a stereotypical fraternal identity for the country which limits the advancement of the society as a whole.

The issue of drug use is not as large an issue in Kyrgyzstan as elsewhere in the region, but it is important to include it in a discussion of social issues related to identity. This report addresses the institutions which are fighting the problem and the impact drug use has on the society at large. Particular emphasis is given to the threats posed by drug trafficking on the economic, societal, and political nature of the country.

http://www.citeulike.org/article/8597092

The article focuses chiefly on the perception of the term “LGBT” while offering a discussion of the LGBT group, which is often perceived as having its own identity but is not recognized in the field of identity construction for Kyrgyz citizens. Comparison could be made between this group and smaller ethnic communities in Kyrgyzstan.

**Identity and Religion**

Separate from the category of social issues related to identity is the impact of religion on identity construction and political activity. Religion plays an inseparable role in the development of identity in Central Asia. Developing a clear picture of the political decisions and attempts to create a national identity over the last decade requires an equally unobstructed view of the role of religion in Kyrgyz society. It is particularly important that the question of religion be addressed as there is no clear vision on the role the institution should play in society. Each Central Asian republic has created a unique answer to the question, and understanding the Kyrgyz response helps to frame the issue of identity construction more clearly. These three articles share the common perspective of viewing Islam in Kyrgyzstan as a political tool of the state used to
foster a post-Soviet identity for the nation. This is by and large counter to the opinion held among much of the populace.

DOI: 10.1080/00905991003653140

Biard’s article discusses the use of Islam in the creation of a national identity juxtaposed with the universalist nature of Islam. The contradictory Islamic identities which develop out of this ethno-national rhetoric has led to the subjectivization of religious beliefs and two separate Islamic identities—one state controlled and the other independent.


Using a long historical lens, this article addresses the development of the role of Islam over the twentieth century in order to explain the role of the religion in the post-Soviet period. This perspective helps the reader to further understand the nature of identity politics in the region.


McGlinchey argues that the political instability in Kyrgyzstan during the post-Soviet period has increased the role of Islam in the community structure. The article is supported by survey research and discusses the major themes of revivalism, Islamic identity, secularism, the relationship between religion and nationalism, and Kyrgyz-Uzbek ethnic relations.

Identity and International-Level Analysis
The third category which is imperative in the analysis and understanding of identity construction and political action in Kyrgyzstan is the foreign policy decisions of the state. In both
regional and global political relationships the nationalist stance of the changing administrations in Kyrgyzstan has always played a role. The dramatic shifts in leadership experienced by the state during the last decade created a varied approach to the role of Kyrgyzstan on the international stage. This, combined with the image of Kyrgyzstan as the best example of democracy in the region and the often strained relationship with neighboring republics, has placed the state in an unusual position relative to the surrounding republics. The selections here represent the responses of the various administrations to the unique role of Kyrgyzstan and to the question of national identity on an international stage.


The article questions the application of realist paradigm models for small states focusing on the case of Kyrgyzstan. More theoretically driven, the article focuses on the role of Kyrgyzstan in the international political scene.


This article discusses the efforts of the state to construct a national identity despite a lack of substantive sources for a Kyrgyz identity. The attempt at identity construction is accurately examined by focusing on the precarious economic and political situation of the Republic during the last two decades.


The article discusses the interpretation of the “war on terror” by the Akaev administration as a means of pursuing Kyrgyz dissenting
groups rather than actual “terrorist organizations.” The author argues that the idea of a happy Kyrgyzstan threatened by outsiders (including the U.S.) was an attempt by the Akaev administration to consolidate a Kyrgyz identity during the period.

http://www.citeulike.org/user/irinas/article/8045052

The essay discusses social and political problems associated with the territorialization of Kyrgyzstan, focusing specifically on the social phenomenon of “creeping migration.” Such migration entails the illegal leasing or purchase of Kyrgyz border land by citizens of neighboring Tajikistan. It is at the borders that we see the clearest attempts by states to affect identity, and the article by Reeves highlights the methods employed by the state to achieve a specific goal.


Approaching the issue of identity in Kyrgyzstan from an exterior perspective, the article examines the Kyrgyz migrant community in Russia and Kazakhstan. Through this analysis the authors argue that the approach to citizenship for this community is pragmatic and the attachment to the concept of a Kyrgyz nation does not have a great deal of strength.

**Identity and State-Level Political Analysis**
The creation of ethnic identity nationalism at the federal level has been a priority across administrations and has permeated discussion at all levels of analysis throughout the decade. The relationship between identity construction and government legitimacy is a theme highlighted by many authors throughout the selection and indicates the importance of the issue in Kyrgyzstan during the last ten years. The articles listed in this section are important because they address the issues of political development and identity constructions through the eyes of the Kyrgyz state and the Kyrgyz people, making
these articles the most effective pieces on the role of ethnicity and the relationship of state policy with implementation and impact.


The article discusses the political geographic issues for deadly armed conflict between groups of ethnic Uzbeks and Kyrgyz in southern Kyrgyzstan. The discussion highlights the role of north-south political competition, an uneasy economic relationship with its western neighbor, widespread official corruption, and the penetration of organized crime into government structures.


http://www.citeulike.org/user/slowrance/article/7272775

This article addresses the question of electoral stability by comparing eleven elections—six of which led to continuity in authoritarian rule and five of which led to the victory of the opposition—that took place between 1998 and 2008 in competitive authoritarian regimes countries located in the post-communist region.


DOI:10.2753/PPC1075-8216540403

Particular emphasis is placed on the post-Soviet state formation, including organized coercion, the presence of legal order based on the rule of law, and the source of the leadership’s money. The discussion of these topics is not based around theoretical perspectives or identity construction, but rather on the transition of the state from a Moscow-dependent entity based on Soviet ideology to an independent nation seeking to find a new conceptual framework.

Hierman, Brent (2010, March). “What use was the election to us? clientelism and political trust amongst ethnic Uzbeks in
Hierman’s article discusses the relationship between Uzbek citizens and their representatives during the 2007 election cycle. Although only half the paper focuses on the Kyrgyz situation specifically, the nature of Uzbek identity from the Uzbek perspective is valuable information in the attempt to understand the full scope of political activity and identity development in Kyrgyzstan during the last decade. The study based on interviews offers a more intimate analysis of the situation.


The author conducts extensive interviews with thirty-six members of the Kyrgyz political opposition leadership, contextualizing findings with existing literature on party politics and inter-party cooperation. The article details the localism and de facto political situation in the country during the time since the Tulip Revolution, and accurately explains the political situation leading to the events of April 2010.


The article develops an approach to researching “ethnicity” and “ethnic conflict” through the use of focus groups. The article analyzes the concept of authentic “Uzbekness” or “Kyrgyzness” predicated primarily on the performance of endogenous kinship practices and Muslim/Soviet notions of class morality, nuanced by geography.

The article discusses the interrelated processes of government legitimization, state formation, and the crafting of a national ideology by the government of Kyrgyzstan following the collapse of the Soviet Union. Emphasis is given to debates among both politicians and members of civil society concerning national ideology during the administration of Kyrgyz President Askar Akaev.


http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0967067X0700463#

The article examines the relationship between citizens and the state, arguing that at the time of writing the weak Kyrgyz state government prevented a strong sense of attachment to the state and a willingness to support state institutions. These issues are addressed using field research studies conducted by the authors in 2007.


DOI: 10.1080/10803920701776996

The interviews with respondents present a telling portrait of the most democratic state in Central Asia since the 2005 revolution, including its relations with the other countries in the region and with the United States, Russia, and China, as well as the problems it faces such as drug smuggling, corruption, and the distribution of water.
An Annotated Bibliography of Periodical Literature
Obtained in Abkhazia 6–11 June 2008

PAUL CREGO
LIBRARY OF CONGRESS

This material, published in Abkhazia, is in several different languages. Much Russian-language material published in the Russian Federation was also for sale, but is not covered in this article.

1. Абхазский благовестник
   [Abkhazian herald]
   Sukhum : “Dom pechati”
   56 p. : ill. ; 30 cm.
   Undated
   “Православный журнал.”
   “Одобрен издательским советом Русской Православной Церкви.”
   In Russian.
   Among the articles in this issue is one about the Drand Cathedral, a very important church building located in Mokva. It may be as old as the sixth century. The author, Mira Konstantinovna Khotelashvili-Inal-Ipa, discusses historical and architectural matters and concludes that this is likely the church in honor of the Theotokos that Justinian had built in Abkhazia and that is mentioned by Justinian’s historianProcopius. Other articles include monastic biographies and several on repentance.

2. Аказара
   [Art]
   Sukhum : Abkhazian Ministry of Culture
   16 p. : ill. ; 30 cm.
   Quarterly?
   “Издается с 1979 г. раахыс.” [Published since 1979.]
   Description based on: 2007, no. 1.
   In Abkhazian.
Articles in this journal cover theater, painting, music, dance, and architecture.

3. Акэа
[Sukhum]
Sukhum : Respublika Abkhazia
347 p. : ill. ; 26 cm.
“Журнал литературы, науки и публицистики.”
Description based on: 2006, no. 1.
In Abkhazian and Russian.
Poems, short stories, essays. A prominent article in this issue is a summary of Biblical history in Abkhazian and Russian: “Ађышьа историяна иазэккађёны = Краткая Священная история.”

4. Алашара
[Light]
Sukhum : Union of Abkhazian Writers
200 p. : ill. ; 27 cm.
Monthly
“Published since 1955.”
Description based on: 2008, no. 1.
In Abkhazian.
Primarily a literary journal with poems and literary excerpts. There are also some short biographical articles. It was started at a time when publishing in the Abkhazian language was once again being permitted after several years of suppression.

5. Амцахара
[Amtskhara = Group of closely-related kin]
Sukhum : Union of Veterans of the Patriotic War, 1992–1993
8 p. : ill. (some col.) ; 42 cm.
Monthly
“Газета основана в 2000 г.”
Description based on: 2008, no. 7 (104) (6–9 June 2008).
In Russian and Abkhazian.
Articles include “We have serious doubts about the impartiality of the UN.” The article conveys concerns of Sergei Shamba, Foreign Minister of Abkhazia, about the position of the UN, which he believes has favored the Georgian side. Another article, “Under the sacred Shapsug trees,” relates the visit of the author, Ėsma Dzhikirba, to a sacred forest in the territory of the Shapsugs, a
Circassian tribe to the north of Abkhazia and in the Russian Federation. The relationships among the Abkhazians, Circassians [or Adyge], and the Georgians continue to be an ongoing part of the way in which these groups often play one off against another.

6.  WARRANT

[Abkhazia]
Sukhum
8 p. : ill. ; 42 cm.
2 issues per week
Description based on: 2008, no. 42/43 (19,586).
In Abkhazian.

This newspaper is one of the first publications of any sort in the Abkhazian language. It was founded in 1919 by Dmitri Gulia (spelled Гәлиа in Abkhazian Cyrillic), who is recognized as the father of Abkhazian literature.

The lead article in this issue is about the meeting that Abkhazian President Sergei Bagapsh had with the foreign ministers of various countries in the European Union.

7.  БАРАКЯТ

[Blessing]
Sukhum : Spiritual Board of the Muslims of the Republic of Abkhazia
8 p. : ill. ; 30 cm.
Monthly
“Газета Духовного Управления мусульман Республики Абхазия.”
In Russian.

Articles in the April and May issues include: “Sources on the spread of Islam in Abkhazia,” “The connection of morality with faith,” “The story of an American Jew who became a Muslim,” and “The path of coffee: the Muslim origin of the drink.” An article in the May edition, “Eternal Peace,” discusses the doctrines of resurrection, judgment, and eternal life in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.

8.  ЧЕГЕМСКАЯ ПРАВДА

[Chegem truth]
Sukhum : Chegemmaia Pravda
The lead article in this issue, “Quantity does not grow into quality,” talks about the recent visits of a number of foreign ministers from European Union countries to Abkhazia. Another article, “The president of Georgia is guilty of manipulation,” originated in the French newspaper Le Figaro, and accuses the Saakashvili government of staging the bombing of buses that carried people over the Inguri River on 21 May to vote in the Georgian Parliament election.

Among the articles in this issue is “Immigration aspects,” which discusses the predicament of the size of the ethnic Abkhazian population within the Republic of Abkhazia. The author of this article, Teimuraz Achugba, argues against the repatriation of Georgians, who were “resettled here in their day as colonizers of a sort …” Another article, “Kuban-Abkhazia: the ties grow stronger,” discusses the “Days of Abkhazian Culture” celebrated on 30 May in the Krasnodar region.

Newspaper of the Aidgylara [Unity] Party. Articles are generally of political interest. The front page of this issue carries a photograph titled “Day of the President,” in honor of the 14 May birthday of the Republic of Abkhazia’s first president, Vladislav Ardzinba. “Javier Solana will visit Abkhazia” announces the impending visit of the
High Representative for the Common Foreign and Security Policy of the European Union. An inside article tells of “The secret visit of I. Alasania in Sukhum (or how Georgian-Abkhazian negotiations have been renewed).” Irakli Alasania, at the time, was the Republic of Georgia’s representative to the United Nations.

11. Футбол Абхазии
   [Abkhazian Soccer]
   Sukhum : Federatsiia futbola RA
   4 p. : ill. ; 42 cm.
   No. 1 (1) (June 2008) –
   In Russian.
   Articles include information on the history of soccer in Abkhazia, as well as current information on the sport in Abkhazia.

12. Гал [ = Гали]
   [Gali]
   6 p. : ill. ; 42 cm.
   Semi-monthly
   “Социально-политическая газета.”
   Description based on: 2008, no. 3 (67) (April 2008).
   In Mingrelian, Russian, and Abkhazian.
   Mingrelian is seldom used as a written language, so this is a rare publication. The Mingrelian language uses the Georgian script with a few additions. That Mingrelian is used as a written language would be perceived as an affront by some Georgians, who would insist that Georgian is the proper written language for Mingrelians. A line from the General Declaration of Human Rights is given on the front page: “All nations are equal and have the right to speak and write in their native language.” Part of the agenda of this newspaper is to encourage some amount of separation between Mingrelians and Georgians. The former have been counted, with some exceptions, as Georgians throughout most of the twentieth century. Often Abkhazian historians will treat Mingrelians as a separate nationality; this is rejected by the Georgians and by most Mingrelians.
   This issue has official decrees and announcements, mainly in Russian and Mingrelian. Obituaries are included. An article in Russian, “I am a citizen of the Republic of Abkhazia,” is about obtaining Abkhazian passports in the Gali District.
13. Голос нартов  
[Voice of the Narts]  
Sukhum : “Narta”  
8 p. : ill. (some col.) ; 42 cm.  
Monthly?  
In Russian.  
No. 1 (June 2008) –  
“Social-political newspaper”  
The first issue of this newspaper contains congratulatory messages from political and social leaders of Abkhazia, including President Sergei Bagapsh, Foreign Minister Sergei Shamba, and President of the Federation of Independent Trade Unions Azaret Alba. Feature article, “The last war of the knights of the Caucasus,” speaks of the battle at “Red Field,” where Abkhazians along with their Adyghe brothers fought the last battle of the war against Imperial Russia. This battle took place on 21 May 1864 and included Georgians on the side of Russia. Another article, “If Russia does not recognize South Ossetia, Abkhazia, and Transdniester in the coming days, then the USA, the countries of the EU, and NATO will by 2010,” discusses Russia’s position in connection with the “frozen conflicts” of post-Soviet space and how these might later be resolved if Russia does not soon give them recognition. The name of the organization that publishes this newspaper, “Narts,” refers to legendary and heroic men and women whose tales are told throughout the Caucasus.

14. Гражданское общество [ = Ауаажадарра]  
[Civil Society]  
Sukhum : Tsentr gumanitarnykh program  
31 p. : ill. ; 30 cm.  
“Информационно-аналитический журнал.”  
Description based on: no. 79 (2007)  
In Russian and Abkhazian.  
The Center for Humanitarian Programs is an NGO in Sukhum that works toward the creation of civil society and its institutions. It has also been involved in confidence building exercises with Georgians.  
This issue includes an article, “The Abkhazian language—the state language of Abkhazia,” which explains the new law [Nov. 2007] that is mandating the exclusive use of Abkhazian as the language of government and working toward its increasing use in
society in general. Russian has heretofore been the public language of Abkhazia due to the fact that the Abkhazians are, even without the Georgians who used to live in Abkhazia, still a minority within their own republic. Another important article, “George Hewitt answers for us,” answers several assertions made by Andrew Anderson in an online Q & A called “Abkhazian conflict: Nine questions and answers” [http://www.conflicts.rem33.com/images/abkhazia/abkh_quest_answ.htm].

15. Համշեն [ = Ամշեն]
[Hamshen: general term for Armenians who live on the Black Sea coast in Russia, Georgia, and Turkey; includes some Sunni Muslim Armenians]
Sukhum : Armenian Community of the Republic of Armenia
4 p. : ill. ; 42 cm.
In Armenian and Russian.
Articles include official material from the Abkhazian-Armenian Community Council. Others deal with Nagorno-Karabakh and political affairs in the Republic of Armenia.

16. Новый взгляд
[New view]
Sukhum : Respublika Abkhazia [printed in Moscow]
80 p. : col. ill. ; 29 cm.
Quarterly
Description based on: 2007, no. 4.
In Russian.
Glossy magazine with colored illustrations and advertisements for items not affordable for the vast majority of the population of Abkhazia. Articles include an interview with Abkhazia’s President Sergey Baghapsh. Foreign Minister Sergey Shamba’s article outlines the case for Abkhazia’s independence based on the jurisdictional history of the past two centuries. The Sukhumi Primate Centre is highlighted in another article.

17. Новый день [ = Амш фыц]
[New day]
Sukhum : “Arash”
4 p. : ill. ; 45 cm.
Weekly
“Издаётся с февраля 2004 г.”
Description based on: 2008, no. 22 (179) (30 May 2008).
In Russian and Abkhazian.
The lead article of this issue, “The State—a System of Values,” is an interview with Akhra Bzhania, who is the president of the Guild of Journalists and Publicists, an organization that deals with issues of the press as well as government corruption. Another article, “How to Preserve Power,” compares the methods of China’s Mao Tse-Tung and Abkhazia’s nemesis Lavrenti Beria. Beria, a Mingrelo-Georgian, was born in Abkhazia.

18. Нужная
[Necessary]
Sukhum: “Nuzhnaia”
6 p.: ill.: 43 p.
Weekly
Description based on: 2008, no. 21 (3 June 2008).
In Russian.
One of the lead articles, “How will the Olympic ambitions of Russians involve us?” speaks about the possibilities for Abkhazia’s economy in connection with the Sochi Winter Olympics of 2014. The article is written in the context of the agreement signed between Abkhazia’s President Bagapsh and the governor of the Krasnodar region of Russia. The article focuses on the 100 million tons of raw material, including sand and crushed stone, that will be exported for the construction of buildings for the Olympics.

19. Правда Абхазии
[Truth of Abkhazia]
Sukhum: Communist Party of the Republic of Abkhazia
4 p.: ill.: 42 cm.
10 issues per year
“Газета основана 7 ноября 1997 года.”
Description based on: 2008, no. 4 (100) (May 2008).
In Russian.
Contains decrees from the Abkhazian Communist Party. Includes a “Communique to the Abkhazian Diaspora” on the topic of Kosovo’s declaration of independence and what that may mean for the recognition of the Republic of Abkhazia. This issue also contains a letter to Russia’s President Putin on the occasion of the 15th
anniversary of the Caucasian Committee of Solidarity with Abkhazia that was formed among the “seven million Caucasian diaspora in Turkey” during the time of “Georgian aggression against Abkhazia.”

20. Православная Абхазия [ = Аҧъсны Аиашахатара]
   [Orthodox Abkhazia]
   Sukhum : Sukhumo-Abkhazskaia Eparkhiia
   8 p. : ill. (some col.) ; 43 cm.
   Monthly
   Description based on: 2008, no. 3 (29) (March 2008).
   In Russian and Abkhazian.
   The Sukhum-Abkhazian Eparchy maintains ties with Orthodoxy, to some extent, through the Patriarchate of Moscow and the Russian Orthodox Church. The Georgian Orthodox Church disapproves of this relationship.
   This issue focuses on the celebration of Easter and the Resurrection of Christ. The death of Archbishop Laurus of the Russian Church Abroad is noted. An article on the Orthodox Church of America appears in Abkhazian. Another article, “The conception of the missionary activity of the Russian Orthodox Church,” focuses on the theology of mission in Orthodoxy.

21. Республика Абхазия
   [The Republic of Abkhazia]
   Sukhum : Parliament and Executive of Abkhazia
   6 p. : ill. ; 43 cm.
   3 issues per week [approx.]
   “Газета издается с сентября 1991 г.”
   Description based on: 2008, no. 62 (2230) (7–8 June 2008).
   In Russian.
   This is the official newspaper of the Abkhazian government. Some laws and decrees are published in this newspaper. Other articles include “Congress of organizations of the veterans of war ‘Aruaa’” and “Concerning contacts of Abkhazia with Russia.” The organization “Aruaa” is seen by some as a rival to another organization of veterans called “Amtsakhara.”

22. Спортивная Абхазия
   [Athletic Abkhazia]
Sukhum : Ministry of Education, Government Committee on Youth and Sport Affairs
6 p. : ill. (some col.) ; 42 cm.
Monthly
“Газета издается с августа 2005 г."
In Russian.
Articles cover current events and history of sports in Abkhazia.

23. Сухум [ = Акэа]
[Sukhum]
Sukhum : Sukhumi City Admin.
8 p. : ill. ; 30 cm.
“Газета выходит с 19 августа 1998 г.”
In Russian and Abkhazian.
In addition to articles specifically about the city of Sukhum, there are also articles about foreign relations, including “Baïkal becomes closer,” which describes an agreement of friendship between the cities of Sukhum and Baïkal, and “Embassy of the Republic of South Ossetia opens in Sukhum.”

24. Сухумский вестник
[Sukhum Herald]
Sukhum : Assotsiatsiia Sukhumtsev
4 p. : ill. ; 43 cm.
Monthly
In Russian.
The lead article in this issue, “Short history of the foundation of the capital of Abkhazia,” begins with the Greek colony of Dioscurias and the Roman fortress city of Sebastopolis, citing Timosthenes of Rhodes and his report that 300 languages were spoken in the markets of Dioscurias. The nineteenth and twentieth centuries are discussed in detail.
REVIEWS


Alif Baa: Introduction to Arabic Letters and Sounds is the third edition of the introductory volume to the widely used al-Kitaab textbook series. This new edition introduces changes to the design and media interface of the book that significantly enhance it as a gateway to the al-Kitaab series and as an introduction to the Arabic language.

The Book: Like its predecessor, this edition of Alif Baa is aimed at beginning students and is intended for classroom use. The book introduces students to the pronunciation and writing of the Arabic alphabet, a vocabulary of over 200 words and phrases, and various aspects of Arab culture. The book’s curriculum can be completed in four to five weeks, with students devoting approximately two hours to homework for every hour spent in class. Students who successfully complete the book will have mastered the alphabet, be able to read and write simple phrases and sentences, and be able to engage in simple conversational exchanges; the authors suggest that students should attain ACTFL Novice Mid to Novice High proficiency upon completing the book.

The ten units of Alif Baa introduce and drill students in the letters and sounds of the Arabic alphabet and present vocabulary grouped around language functions such as greetings, introductions, etc. Words containing letters students have yet to learn are given in transliteration. Conversation sections include cultural notes relevant to the topics covered and the book discusses issues such as roots and

---

1 This review is based on the Teacher’s Edition of Alif Baa (ISBN: 978-1-58901-705-4) and on personal experience teaching from the book in the fall semester of 2010. The Teacher’s Edition includes (pp. 3–19) an answer key to many of the book’s drills.
patterns, the registers of Arabic, handwriting, calligraphy, and the
development of the Arabic script. Prefaces directed to both students
and teachers explain the book’s pedagogical philosophy and design.
Finally, the book includes both Arabic-English and English-Arabic
glossaries of words introduced in its lessons.

**What’s New in the Third Edition:** *Alif Baa* has been thoroughly
redesigned in this new edition and now utilizes full color throughout,
including pictures and color-highlighted text, making the book both
more visually appealing and pedagogically useful. Unlike its
predecessor, Egyptian and Levantine colloquial Arabic vocabulary
items (easily distinguished by color coding) are introduced
throughout the book alongside their formal/written equivalents. The
authors suggest that instructors ask students to focus on one of these
two dialects, in addition to Standard Arabic.

By far the most significant change in this edition is access to a
well-designed and easily navigable companion website
(alkitaabtextbook.com) that is an integral part of the *Alif Baa*
learning process. In a typical chapter, students will use the website to
learn new letters, do listening exercises, play vocabulary games, etc.
Many exercises provide immediate feedback in the form of visual
and audio cues, such as a green check and a spoken “mumtaaz!” for
a correct answer. The website also allows students to click on
vocabulary words to hear and see them pronounced by native
speakers. Conversation is practiced through video clips showing
exchanges in Levantine and Egyptian dialects. Students can not only
watch and listen to these conversations, but interact with them by
playing a role in the exchange and recording their speech on the
website. These recordings can then be accessed by the teacher for
assessment. Cultural components such as poetry recitation and
calligraphy are also included on the website.

The website can be used by instructors to track and grade student
activity, post announcements, make assignments, and generally
manage a course. This is an interesting and potentially useful feature,
but one that largely duplicates the functions of course-management
software already used by many universities. Likewise, the usefulness
of the website as a course-management tool is limited to the four to
six weeks students will be using *Alif Baa* (although a revised third
edition of *al-Kitaab*, part one, with a companion website is
scheduled for release in July 2011).
Evaluati
on: This redesigned edition of Alif Baa brings significant improvements to what was already a fine introductory textbook. The commitment to communicative teaching is continued in this edition and greatly enhanced by the addition of the website. The website offers clear advantages: unlike the previous edition’s DVDs, the website cannot be lost or damaged, and the website will enable the publishers to continuously correct and update material. While praise for the website was unanimous among my students, students on campuses without easy internet connectivity may find the replacement of the DVD with the website less welcome. And, although Alif Baa comes with a DVD that contains the audio and video files necessary to complete homework exercises, the DVD is a poor substitute for the website.

The introduction of Levantine and Egyptian dialects in Alif Baa reflects the authors’ belief that competence in Arabic entails mastery of both formal/written and colloquial/spoken registers of the language. It also reflects their desire to use language registers appropriate to context; thus, greetings and introductions are presented in dialectal registers commonly used for such everyday interactions. For those who agree with this philosophy, Alif Baa provides the means to introduce dialect in realistic and useful ways; nevertheless, the book can easily be used by those who want their students to focus solely on Standard Arabic (though the website’s dialogues are presented only in colloquial registers).

Teachers should be aware that some drills in the book may prove too ambitious: in Unit 4 (p. 87), for example, students are asked to write sentences before they have learned about the structure of Arabic sentences, which may result in errors and confusion. Instructors should also be aware that written colloquial usages are included in a few reading-aloud drills (e.g., drill 17, p. 165). Only a few errors have slipped past Alif Baa’s editors: on page 222, imra’ah (woman) is spelled with hamzah rather than waslah; on page 216, the pronunciation keys to tanwin fatkah and tanwin kasrah are transposed; in the answer key of the teacher’s edition, the word “tafaddal” in drill 16 [p. 19] is not in correct alphabetical order.

Alif Baa’s greatest strength may be that it realizes the authors’ goal of helping instructors devote more class time to active engagement with Arabic and less to lecturing (in English) about the language. With its well-designed website, the new Alif Baa allows students to learn at home, leaving class time free for actively
practicing what has been learned. In sum, *Alif Baa* is an excellent textbook and an essential introduction to the *al-Kitaab* series that can be confidently recommended to any teacher, program, or library. Given the popularity of the *al-Kitaab* series, *Alif Baa* is a resource that will be of use to almost anyone undertaking Arabic study in the U.S.

GREGORY J. BELL
PRINCETON UNIVERSITY


In *Contesting Realities,* Susanne Dahlgren draws on historical, census, and legal texts to show changes to prevailing notions of propriety and morality in Aden, Yemen, from the end of the Colonial Era (1839–1967) to 2001. One of the primary threads in her analysis is the change, over time, to Aden’s family laws and other laws related to gender as the British Colonial government, the Socialist government, and the unified Yemeni government in turn modified these laws to reflect state ideologies and the social realities each government faced, such as immigration and housing shortages. Dahlgren also takes a number of case studies from her personal experience to demonstrate the manner in which Yemenis today negotiate complex social systems of morality and propriety. Her research is based on interviews with 311 families, visits to family court in Aden including interviews with judges (both male and female), essays written by students at Aden University, and group interviews with men and women at their places of work.

Dahlgren frames her observations within a theory of positive morality—the motivating and creative element of propriety—as opposed to the honor/shame theory that characterizes individuals’ moral identity as that of withholding and avoidance. She discusses
how individuals conceive of and represent themselves as moral within the sometimes conflicting scope of three areas: customs and traditions, religion, and revolution. As she puts it, the project is “to discuss how the simultaneous existence of contesting norms is manifested in daily practice” (p. 11). Dahlgren focuses on the concept of adab (proper comportment), and attempts to flesh out an anthropological analysis of how adab is created and conceptualized in Adeni society beyond the level of etiquette.

This book is valuable for the overview it provides of a wide variety of elements of Adeni society from the 1950s to the 2000s. The broad scope of its contents is brought together in the final chapters where the author’s anthropological frame of reference is fully fleshed out. This book is most appropriate for graduate level readers or later-stage undergraduates in the field of anthropology or Middle East studies. It would be a valuable addition to libraries with strong anthropology, Arabian Peninsula studies, or Islamic studies collections.

The book begins with an introduction wherein the author explains her connection to Aden and her research perspective, followed by chapters on the historical evolution of the city during the time studied, the law and courts in Aden, the effect of the socialist government in Aden, customs and traditions relating to the way people discuss gender and sex in Aden, five illustrative case studies, and a chapter that draws together all the previous information under Dahlgren’s theoretical framework. The book includes appendices containing field survey statistics and notes on the Family Law, a glossary (which is largely unnecessary because Dahlgren does an excellent job of translating and explaining Arabic terms throughout the book), and references. Dahlgren uses footnotes throughout to elaborate on referenced texts and ideas. The book is of fine quality with a well-bound cloth cover, black and white photographs, well-printed graphs, footnotes, and text on alkaline paper.

Susanne Dahlgren is an Academy Research Fellow at the Helsinki Collegium for Advanced Studies, with a Ph.D. from the University of Helsinki and a background studying anthropology and Islamic studies at the University of Edinburgh and the London School of Economics and Political Science.

KATHERINE SYDENHAM

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
Thomas Lippman’s *Arabian Knight* is the first published biography of Colonel Bill Eddy (1896–1962). Colonel Eddy’s life story offers valuable insight into the evolving relationship between the U.S. and the Middle East during the mid-twentieth century. An expert in Middle East culture and languages, Eddy was involved in many of the conflicts and negotiations that have shaped U.S. foreign policy in that part of the world. *Arabian Knight* is an engaging account of Colonel Eddy’s life, written by a well-known author/journalist specializing in Middle East and American foreign affairs.

William Eddy was born in Lebanon, where his parents were Protestant missionaries. He graduated from Princeton University in 1917 and joined the U.S. Marine Corps to fight in France in World War I. Following serious injury and a distinguished record of service in the war, Eddy received a Ph.D. from Princeton and had a successful career in academia before returning to military service in 1941. He served as a Marine Corps officer in Cairo and Tangier until 1943, when he was detailed to the State Department and was assigned to Saudi Arabia.

Colonel Eddy is perhaps best known for the relationship he developed with King Abdul Aziz bin Saud (1876–1953). Eddy played a key role in negotiating and translating the meeting between President Roosevelt and King Abdul Aziz that took place on board a U.S. Navy cruiser in the Red Sea in February 1945, just after the Yalta Conference. After the war, Eddy worked briefly for the State Department in Washington, D.C.; during the late ‘40s and ‘50s, he worked for the Arabian American Oil Company (Aramco) and was based in Beirut, although he maintained strong ties with U.S. government officials. He died in Beirut in 1962.

With *Arabian Knight*, Lippman has selected a well-placed American to chronicle the development of U.S.-Middle East relations, particularly the relationship between Saudi Arabia and the United States during and after World War II. The author’s description of the linguistic, dietary, and logistical challenges Eddy faced and solved during the 1945 meeting of President Roosevelt and
King Abdul Aziz bin Saud forms the heart of the book. With only one week to plan for the meeting between the King and the President, Eddy worked tirelessly to negotiate a variety of cultural disconnects between the U.S. Navy and the King’s entourage. Although the U.S. Navy could accommodate only 20 Saudis on board the ship, the King originally planned to bring 200 in his entourage. The King originally insisted on providing all of the food for his hosts, but since they were not accustomed to eating refrigerated food and were not allowed to eat meat slaughtered more than twenty-four hours previously, they planned to slaughter lambs each day on board the Navy ship for that day’s feast. Due to the King’s leg and foot pain, the Arabs brought carpets to cover the deck of the ship. They also insisted on sleeping outdoors on the deck. Eddy was the only person on board who spoke both English and Arabic and could negotiate these cultural minefields.

Another interesting chapter depicts how Eddy contributed to U.S. government policy while working in the private sector. Throughout his life, he developed ties with government officials in his educational and academic career, military service, and extensive travels. These ties became mutually beneficial during Eddy’s private sector career, and were likely exploited by both sides. Colonel Eddy did not leave a written record of much of the sensitive information he knew or passed along, so there is no definite proof that he was a CIA informant, although it seems likely he shared important information with the CIA.

I found Arabian Knight to be an engaging work that illuminated the expanding role of the United States in the Middle East during the middle of the twentieth century. It is the first biography of William Eddy and it draws on the collection of Eddy’s papers held at Princeton University. Eddy was an important piece of the growing American presence in the Middle East, especially in its relationship with Saudi Arabia. While a valuable contribution to understanding the development of U.S.-Middle East relations, the book leaves many unanswered questions. The author implies that Eddy likely continued working for the CIA after his move to the private sector in the late 1940s, but it is unclear just how much information Eddy provided to the CIA and other government agencies after he left government service. It seems that Eddy’s discretion, which served him very well during his military and State Department career, prevented him from documenting some of his activities in detail and
therefore Eddy’s papers at Princeton do not contain as much detail as researchers may have hoped. Without this additional information, the latter part of the book lacks definition about the influence Eddy had on U.S. policy in the Middle East in his later years.

While Arabian Knight may not be aimed at a scholarly audience, it would be a useful addition to any library that specializes in Middle East-U.S. relations or military biographies. The book also has popular appeal, and WorldCat indicates that it is held by at least as many public libraries as academic libraries.

JUDY ALSPACH

CENTER FOR RESEARCH LIBRARIES


This bibliography, compiled by Salih Altoma, professor emeritus of Arabic at Indiana University, is the result not only of time consuming work but also of high intellectual effort. It lists English-language translations and criticisms of the modern Arabic literature of Iraq (an earlier version of this was published in the form of a journal article in 20041).

The bibliography consists of two main parts. The first part catalogs scholarly and popular works about Iraqi literature published from 1950 to 2008. In the second part of the bibliography, English translations of Iraqi literature are grouped in four chapters: Autobiographical Essays, Drama, Fiction, and Poetry. The chapter on Fiction is divided into two sections: (A) Anthologies and Novels, and (B) Short Stories and Novel Extracts. The next chapter, devoted to poetry, also consists of two sections: (A) Anthologies, and (B) Other Translated Poems.

The book includes acknowledgments, an explanation of the transliteration system used, an introduction, and a list of abbreviations. The introduction is a good guide for students of Arabic literature, especially for those interested in the modern Arabic literature of Iraq, produced both inside the country and in exile.

Two appendices are attached to the bibliography. The first one lists Iraqi writers in Western countries, and the second one is a list of women authors of Iraq. Separate author and translator indexes are designed to enable readers to find information efficiently.

Bibliographic entries are listed with full information, and many of them are also supplied with brief annotations in brackets. Since readers of translations often want to look at the original text, the lack of original Arabic titles within the entries might be considered a deficiency, but this by no means reduces the value and importance of the bibliography as an essential reference tool.

The book is highly recommended for academic and large public libraries.

AKRAM KHABIBULLAEV

INDIANA UNIVERSITY BLOOMINGTON

---


An Introduction to Moroccan Arabic and Culture aims to “enable learners to communicate effectively in Moroccan Arabic.” Its author, Abdellah Chekayri, has been teaching Modern Standard Arabic (MSA) as well as Moroccan Arabic (MA) for over 25 years. He is currently an associate professor and coordinator of the Arabic language program at Al Akhawayn University in Ifrane (Morocco).

The Georgetown Classics in Arabic Language and Linguistics series already counts three volumes dedicated to MA, authored by Richard S. Harrell and originally published between 1962 and 1966: A Short Reference Grammar of Moroccan Arabic, A Basic Course in Moroccan Arabic, and A Dictionary of Moroccan Arabic:
Moroccan-English. An Introduction to Moroccan Arabic and Culture complements this existing set of three very well, providing cultural material in addition to the language course and taking advantage of new technologies, as it comes with an interactive DVD.

The manual is intended for both beginners and students who have already studied MSA. The book uses simultaneous Arabic script and Latin script with embedded Arabic letters to transcribe letters non-existent in Latin. According to the author, both writing systems coexist in Morocco, and Latin script is heavily used to write Arabic. He further argues that limiting himself to Arabic script would not have allowed him to transcribe the exact Moroccan pronunciation (especially vowels). Those who have learned Arabic as a second language all know how different “spoken” Arabic can be from “written” Arabic.

The book opens with 18 pages dedicated to “Letters and sounds,” presenting the writing and pronunciation of Moroccan Arabic. Following are 14 thematic lessons (دروس, دروس), focusing on various aspects of daily life or situations a traveler might encounter: “family” / العائلة, “daily activities” / النشطات اليومية, “traveling” / السفر, etc. Within each chapter students will find three categories:

- Listening/oral comprehension (الاراشام / istimāʿ)
- Grammatical rules (القواعد / qawāʿid)
- Cultural material (الثقافة / thaqāfah)

The objectives of the lesson are clearly stated at the beginning of each chapter. Lots of listening and writing exercises (تمرينات) are included. Upon completing the course, students should be able to handle basic communication (greetings, introductions, simple questions, usage of days and numbers, shopping, etc.).

All lessons refer to the interactive DVD, which contains multimedia material to support the language program. The DVD also covers further sociological aspects of MA, for example the sociolinguistic situation in Morocco or the religious component of the Arabic language. If it can appear a bit ambitious, it remains extremely useful to situate the language within its proper cultural context. Moreover, the DVD provides general information about Morocco’s geography and history as well as 29 various aspects of Moroccan culture, ranging from folk traditions and Moroccan food
to religious education and practice in Morocco. Visually, it is quite basic, with a left-hand side menu for navigation. It is, therefore, extremely easy to use.

At the end of the volume (p. 341), the “Grammar Appendix” includes recapitulative tables of various verb tenses as well as a reminder on the use of adjectives. It is followed by a substantial Moroccan Arabic-English / English-Moroccan Arabic alphabetic glossary. On the back cover it is stated that any purchase by an institutional language lab will automatically include rights to post an electronic copy of the DVD content on a secure (password-protected) network for use by students and faculty at that institution. The book is printed on acid-free paper.

If few manuals for Moroccan Arabic were published before the 1990s, the situation has changed greatly since then. Even though it competes with many other MA manuals, however, An Introduction to Moroccan Arabic and Culture stands out as it succeeds, in addition to language teaching, in preparing students on a cultural level for traveling in Morocco and holding discussions with Moroccans. Any academic library aiming to support an Arabic language and linguistics program should definitely consider purchasing An Introduction to Moroccan Arabic and Culture.

Anais Salamon
McGill University


Roy Armes (author of the excellent Dictionary of African Filmmakers [IUP, 2008]) has created a unique and essential document for the study of Arab cinema. While it is a fine biographical dictionary, there is much more to it: brief but insightful reviews of featured films; country by country filmographies; and
illuminating narratives of the political history of each state, and how this affected their film industry.

The reader knows she has come upon something uncommon right from the start, when the author declares that he will only be considering films and filmmakers from the Arab Central lands (Mashriq). This means excluding the vibrant film industry of Egypt (not to mention the North African countries). With its long history, galaxy of film stars, and success throughout the Arab world, this is a bold move. Indeed, since the 1920s the Egyptian film industry has made three times the number of films made in all the other Arab lands. The only Egyptian filmmakers Armes includes are those who have made films in the Mashriq countries. But this exclusion gives Armes the room to discuss much more uncommon topics—Arab documentary films and their makers, and the Palestinian cinema. Also, one of Armes’ themes is the interaction of film and politics—since few Egyptian films in the great number produced have dealt with this topic, the Egyptian cinema does not belong in his work.

It quickly becomes clear that Armes believes that film can be an important part of political struggle. He concentrates his discussions on the feature and documentary films which do that. Of course, the Palestinian cinema is a leader in this, with its role in the struggle for independence, but he asserts that all Arab cinema is essentially a cinema of struggle. All of the Arab countries are involved spiritually with the struggle against Israel, and most of them have their own internal political struggles as well.

The book is divided into four main parts. The Introduction contains Armes’ discussion of the political history of the Arab countries and how this has affected each country’s cinematic development. These are very fine, and insightful. They manage to balance detailed examinations of both the politics and the cinema of a country. They are important readings for anyone interested in the interplay of cinema with politics. Armes covers all of the Arab countries including Yemen, the Gulf, and Saudi Arabia. His discussion of these countries is a welcome addition to the little which has been written about their cinemas. In all his treatments of the various countries Armes discusses the whole cinema scene from major feature directors to obscure documentary ones. Embedded in separate side boxes in this section around the main text are in-depth reviews of various films featured in the narrative (the films reviewed date from 1962 till 2005). These too are insightful and welcome. The average reader would find these very useful as a guide for his
viewing. Wisely, Arab diaspora filmmakers are not lumped together for discussion, but Armes treats them as part of the country of their origin. He is sensitive to the fact that there are many reasons for this diaspora of filmmakers, not only censorship and political persecution in their home country, but the availability of funds in the West. The West is also the place where many of these men and women have received their technical training. This introductory essay is also equipped with fine bibliographical notes.

Part 1 is the Dictionary of Filmmakers itself. It makes up the bulk of the book. The dictionary is organized in alphabetical order by last name (e.g., Abbas, Hiam). Each entry gives where and when the person was born; where he or she received training and education; and lastly a chronological list of the individual’s films—feature and documentary. There are usually no editorial comments, although several directors receive a brief narrative of their careers. One of the unique characteristics of the dictionary is that documentary filmmakers whose work is relatively obscure are included with more accomplished directors like Nabil el-Maleh, Michel Khleifi, and Mohamed Mala. Transliteration of names and titles is a problem. The LC standard is not used, and transliteration seems random. This is a serious drawback in a dictionary.

Part 2 is given over to Feature Film Chronologies. These are potted sketches of the film industry of each Arab country. The information given includes a listing of filmmakers from that country (a section which lists Arab directors from foreign countries who work in the country under discussion is also included). United Arab Emirates has the most filmmakers with 395! Not all of the directors listed in this part have an entry in the Dictionary section. How many films the country has made since the start of its industry is also given. The bulk of each entry is made up of a chronology of the films made in that country with the director listed.

Part 3 is an Index of Feature Film Titles. It is arranged alphabetically, but using the film’s French or English title. This is unhelpful, and really unexplainable. Arabic titles are also given, but they are not given in LC standard transliteration. This makes for confusion. Each entry in the list gives the director and the country of origin.

Lastly, the book boasts a useful bibliography. What is needed in the editorial tools, though, is a thorough index. The book seems like three different books put together but not really achieving cohesion. An index would allow a reader to trace a director or film wherever it
appears in the book’s different sections. It would also of course aid in allowing one to find a director or film quickly.

This book is excellent and wide ranging, but it does not live up to the promise of its name. A Dictionary of Arab Filmmakers makes the reader think that he is consulting just that. The book’s scope, however, is not the entire Arab world, but merely the countries of the Mashriq (Jordan, Lebanon, Syria, Iraq, Palestine, Saudi Arabia, Yemen, and the Gulf). North Africa and the very important Egyptian cinemas are excluded. Also, Armes is specifically interested in cinema of political struggle. This has led him to give more space to that genre, either in feature film or documentary form, and to emphasize the Palestinian struggle and those films which deal with it. On the other hand, he has produced an excellent essay about the interaction of politics and cinema in the Arab world, which is worth consulting by anyone interested in this topic. Further, Armes has created a great resource for the study of Arab documentaries, and the book will become an important work for just this reason.

DAVID GIOVACCHINI

STANFORD UNIVERSITY


The increased interest and research on Jews in the Islamic World has produced a constantly growing volume of publications in numerous disciplines, venues, and languages. Locating bibliographic data on this field is difficult, because bibliographies focusing on the Islamic World do not systematically cover sources dealing with Jews and Judaica and vice versa. Brill, who is the current publisher of Index Islamicus, and makes great efforts to promote research and publications on Jews in the Islamic World, has now published a bibliography dedicated to this field. It includes 12,183 entries, as well as subject and names indexes.
The bibliography includes citations of works mainly in European languages and Hebrew. It draws from various sources, chief among them being *Index Islamicus* (listing articles and monographs in Western languages from 1906 on) and *Rambi* (an online database listing articles in Western languages and Hebrew on Jewish studies from 1960 on). In addition, several publications on Jewish-Islamic studies which appeared before 1906 are included, and some Hebrew-language journals published before 1960 were also examined. Special attention was given to journals dedicated to the field of Sephardi and Middle Eastern and North African Jews.

The focus of the bibliography is on Jews living under Muslim rule, or in countries with a Muslim majority even when these countries were not under Muslim rule, as was the case with North African and Middle Eastern countries under French and British rule during parts of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. As for Palestine/Israel, for the period preceding the establishment of the state of Israel, the bibliography includes publications on the local Jewish population and immigrants from Muslim countries, but not on Jewish immigrants and immigration from Europe; for the later period, only publications on Mizrahi Jews are included. Some works on Mizrahi immigrants outside the Islamic World are also cited. As for Jewish languages, the emphasis is on languages used in the Islamic World: thus, studies on Judeo-Spanish and Hebrew are not cited except for their use and study in Muslim countries.

The bibliography is arranged by broad topical subjects (e.g., religion, law, philosophy, sciences, art, Jewish languages and literatures) and by region (the Muslim world in general and specific countries), all further subdivided. Within each section entries are arranged alphabetically by author, then by title for edited works or those without an author. Hebrew titles are romanized and in many cases a translation of the title or some subject notation is added.

This bibliography is a pioneering project in that it is the first one to cover the whole region and not just parts of it (e.g., North Africa) and is arranged both thematically and geographically. All entries are numbered sequentially and the total number of entries is impressive (12,183), but it should be noted that the actual number of works cited is smaller, since many works are entered under more than one topic. Thus, one can find an entry regardless of whether one is scanning a specific thematic or geographic section; some bibliographies choose to solve this issue by adding “see also” entry numbers at the end of
each section. Comparing this bibliography to one published almost twenty years earlier and covering part of the region, Robert Attal’s *Les juifs d’Afrique du Nord: Bibliographie* (Jerusalem: Ben-Zvi Institute, 1993), shows that although Attal’s bibliography also treats the pre-Islamic period it includes 10,062 entries, most of them dealing with the Islamic period, and numerous relevant citations are not included in the current bibliography. The major reason for this is that Attal’s bibliography refers to a greater number of journals in both European languages and Hebrew, though not all of them are scholarly ones. Still, it is strange that articles from some important periodicals, such as *Shorashim ba-Mizrah*, are missing.

The subject index (pp. 459–480) can be quite helpful in pinpointing specific works (e.g., loanwords from one language to another, migration from one country to another) but can also be frustrating (there is almost an entire three-column page of numbered citations relating to Spain). The names index (pp. 481–523) includes authors and editors as well as personal name subjects, which makes the index somewhat confusing. A more serious problem is that several names appear in two forms without cross references. It is stated (p. 481) that “A few elusive persons are listed more than once,” but sporadic examination of the index suggests otherwise (to quote but a few: Abd al-Nasir, Jamal and Nasser, Gamal Abdul with the same citations; Abu Nazzara/Ya’qub Sanu’ and Sanu’ Ya’qub/Abu Nazzara with the same citations; Sa’adon, Hayyim and Saadoun, Haim with partially different citations; and Eraki Klorman, Bat-Zion [22 citations] and Klorman Eraki, Bat-Zion [one citation]). While it is true that the multitude of languages and the existence of compound names make indexing them a difficult task, many of these duplications could have easily been detected.

This bibliography is an important contribution to the study of Jews in the Islamic World due to its thematic and geographical scopes, especially considering the difficulties in covering such a diverse field and multitude of languages. Despite some indexing weaknesses one can find a wide range of works on numerous subjects, people, and regions, at times pointing to quite esoteric topics, thus making this bibliography an indispensable tool for research on the field.

RACHEL SIMON

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY

Steven R. Ward is a senior CIA intelligence analyst with a specialization in Iran and the Middle East. This is not the first time he has written on Iran; he also authored an article entitled “The Continuing Evolution of Iran’s Military Doctrine.” The purpose of writing Immortal: A Military History of Iran and Its Armed Forces, as Ward explains, is to reveal a possible role that the Iranian military may have in the world in the coming century, and he tries to achieve his purpose by giving a picture of its military history from the beginning of the first Persian empire to the present time, and concluding it with his own analysis of how this role may be achieved.

Ward argues that Iran has often not been victorious during wars in the past two centuries, and there has been a history of inferior leadership, soldiers suffering from ill-treatment and poverty, and destruction of equipment by opponents. Despite these difficulties, Iranian soldiers have not only persevered but have enjoyed some successes, whether during defensive or offensive wars “by hard fighting, clever tactics, and the exploitation of Iran’s imposing geography” (p. xi). Therefore, the author believes that any enemy of Iran should take all this into consideration. In Immortal, a background is also given on the heritage of Iran’s nationalist, tribal, and religious characteristics in order to show the factors that influence the Iranian military, for an understanding of “Iran’s armed forces today and in the future” (p. x).

In Chapter 1, Ward discusses how Iran or Persia rose to become the first world “superpower” from tribes who engaged in cavalry warfare. He notes that the first Persian emperor, Cyrus the Great (r. 550–530 BC), “set the military standard that successor dynasties so often tried but failed to emulate” (p. 11). He goes on in the following chapters to discuss different wars and battles under various Iranian rulers and gives examples of how in times of major losses, internal disputes among Iranian soldiers from different tribes, and with outdated weapons, Iranian soldiers were able to persist and continue fighting.
Reviews

Ward also examines the methods by which some Iranian rulers, from the Safavid dynasty in the late fifteenth century to Muhammad Reza Shah, Ayatollah Khomeini, and the current rulers of Iran, have used God and Shia Islam to recruit members into the military and to try to sustain them. Iran’s geography is mentioned in the beginning of the book as a major hindrance against enemy attacks, and yet the author provides only a few examples of how Iran’s geography has protected its people from enemies.

According to OCLC’s FirstSearch results under Iran--History, Military, and Iran--Armed Forces--History, there is no other title in the English language that covers Iranian military history from the beginning of the first dynasty to the present time. Thus, I found this book to be useful because it is comprehensive, especially regarding information on artillery.

The book is well organized, and most of the chapters include beautifully illustrated maps specifically created for this narrative, of Iranian battlefields, conquered lands under different Iranian leaders, and areas of Iran occupied by other countries for various reasons. The Notes section is an excellent source on where the author found his information, and the Bibliography lists titles for anyone who wants to read further about specific topics mentioned in Immortal. The index section was not as detailed as I would have liked; I wanted to look up the definition of the Arabic word ghulām, which was given somewhere in the beginning chapters and mentioned again later, but I was not able to recall the meaning nor retrieve it from the index.

What I found perplexing about this book was the final analysis, where Ward contradicts himself in several places about the Iranian military’s future role in the world. For example, Ward suggests that Iran, with its small number of longer-range ballistic missiles, “will have few options but to target strategic locations, such as capitals and other population centers, rather than tactical ones. Still, the clerical regime’s past actions suggest that they would be cautious in initiating attacks on population centers against an opponent that can retaliate in kind” (p. 317). In addition, Ward argues that Iran’s deterrence strategy is based on closing the Persian Gulf oil export routes, missile or air attacks against opponents in the region, and terrorism. Then he seems to contradict himself when he states that after a Saudi Shia group supported by Iran attacked U.S. military personnel in Saudi Arabia, Iran withdrew its support because it
feared “an increase in political, economic, and military pressure” (p. 322). He also argues that unless Iran’s conventional forces are improved, the missile and WMD deterrence and unconventional warfare are its only option, although “the least reliable and most risky elements of their military powers” (p. 324). With such statements as these, I found it difficult to accept Ward’s conclusion that Iran may gain a major military role in the world, when it is economically dependent on more powerful countries.

Ward’s transliteration of Persian, Arabic, and other foreign words makes it easy for English language speakers who are unfamiliar with these languages to pronounce the words, and therefore makes the book flow smoothly. Public libraries and university and research libraries will benefit from owning Immortal: A Military History of Iran and Its Armed Forces, not so much for its analysis but because there is no other title which offers a history of the Iranian armed forces from their beginning to the present in English.

NANCY BEYGIJANIAN

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, LOS ANGELES


---

* This list includes books not previously listed which have been received to date and are awaiting review.
FAWZI W. KHOURY RECEIVES
PARTINGTON AWARD FOR 2011

WASHINGTON, DC (Nov. 30)—Senior and junior colleagues in the Middle East Librarians Association (MELA) paid tribute to Mr. Fawzi W. Khoury, retired Middle East bibliographer at the University of Washington and recipient of this year’s Partington Award. The announcement was made during MELA’s annual conference, held this past month in the Smithsonian Institute’s Natural History Museum. Although Mr. Khoury himself was unable to attend the conference, the award committee’s chair Mr. John Eilts reminded the newer members of Mr. Khoury’s contribution to the profession.

The David H. Partington Award was established to recognize members of MELA who have displayed a high standard of excellence, with accomplishments in the field of Middle East librarianship, librarianship in general, and scholarship; and who have given outstanding service to the association.

Mr. Khoury began his career at the University of Washington Libraries in 1967, when the library had only a modest collection on the Near East. He quickly began to expand the coverage in keeping pace with the growing program of teaching at the University of Washington. As a successful negotiator he was able to acquire the PL-480 collection from the University of Southern California and to join that LC-operated program at a time when other institutions were being dropped. Building a base of vendor contacts through many trips to the Middle East, Mr. Khoury was able to enhance the holdings of the UW library and make them a world-class collection for research in the languages of the region.

Mr. Khoury’s service to the profession is an equally impressive record. Within MELA he served in various positions, including President, Vice President, and more importantly as Editor of MELA Notes. It was during this time that MELA Notes evolved from a newsletter to a serious journal in the field of Middle East
Partington Award

Mr. Khoury worked to make it a more professional-looking publication as well as publishing quality articles. Among his other accomplishments were the editing and publishing of two important works in the field: *National Union Catalog of Middle Eastern Microforms* (1989), and *Middle East in Microform: a Union List of Middle Eastern Microforms in North American Libraries* (1992).

As a mentor Mr. Khoury worked with many junior colleagues in the field and he can proudly claim to have prepared his assistants for their later positions at places like the Library of Congress, the University of Arizona, the American University of Kuwait, and others. The Middle East Librarians Association proudly honors Fawzi W. Khoury and thanks him for his service to the profession.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION PLEASE CONTACT:
John Eilts
Partington Award Committee Chair 2011
John.eilts@stanford.edu
http://www.mela.us
GEORGE N. ATIYEH PRIZE WINNERS
2011

This year the George N. Atiyeh Prize committee received two outstanding applicants and thus decided to award both, Ms. Laatifa Bali and Ms. Amanda Click.

Latifa is currently enrolled in the MLIS program at Queens College-CUNY and is currently a Bibliographic Assistant at Butler Library, Columbia University. Born in Morocco, Latifa speaks Arabic and French, and understands the Berber dialect Tamazight. Latifa holds a B.A. in communication studies from Al-Ikkhwayn University in Ifrane, Morocco.

Amanda is currently a Ph.D. student enrolled in the newly-created program Educating Librarians in the Middle East: Building Bridges for the 21st Century at the University of North Carolina in conjunction with Duke University. Amanda is currently taking Arabic with aspirations for studying abroad. She also spent three years living in Cairo while working as a coordinator of instruction in the main library at the American University in Cairo.

Congratulations to both recipients.

The George N. Atiyeh Prize Committee.
Sean Swanick (Chair), McGill University
Ali Houissa, Cornell University
Anaïs Salamon, McGill University
George Atiyeh Award Essay  
A Journey to Priceless Knowledge  

LATIFA BAALI  
QUEENS COLLEGE IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK

My name is Latifa Baali. I am a Moroccan American who decided to become a librarian thanks to my experience as an Arabic copy-cataloger in Butler Library at Columbia University. My daily interactions with colleagues at work convinced me to enroll in a graduate library program in order to fulfill my ambition to become a professional librarian. When I applied for the George Atiyeh Award, I was in my last year of a master’s program in Library Science in Queens College in the City University of New York. Library Science professors in Queens College were always advising students to attend conferences and participate in competitions and workshops in order to enrich their resumes and prepare themselves for a professional career after graduation. These precious words of advice encouraged me to participate in the George Atiyeh competition. The main reason which led me to choose this particular competition is the fact that I have a great interest in becoming a Middle East and North African Studies librarian and I have the skills required to succeed in this field. Moreover, the George Atiyeh Award is always presented during the MELA (Middle East Librarians Association) conference in which professional librarians meet. As a library science graduate student, I needed to establish contact with experts who would advise me on my career.

I learned about the George Atiyeh Award through the MELA website, which I consider an important source of information about Middle East and North African Studies librarianship. I would not know that this website exists if I were not a member of the MELANET listserv. It was thanks to Mr. Karim Boughida that I became a member of MELANET. He suggested that I join the listserv after he noticed my curiosity about MENA librarianship, through various queries I sent to the Mideast listserv.

I was very delighted to be chosen as one of the winners of the George Atiyeh Award for the year 2011. Winners of this award were
provided the opportunity to attend conferences organized by the Middle East Librarians Association (MELA) and the Middle East Studies Association (MESA) in Washington, D.C., between November 29 and December 4, 2011. The George Atiyeh Award is the best gift that a library science student, who is interested in the MENA region, could receive. The award enables winners to meet professional librarians who have an extensive experience in the field of Middle East and North African Librarianship. They learn from them, get advice about a future career, find a mentor, discuss new ideas, and exchange contact information to initiate future work collaboration.

The MELA and MESA conferences in D.C. were a journey of acquiring knowledge, cultural exchange, and professional networking. The first two-day conferences of MELA were a great introduction for me to the world of Middle East and North Africa Librarianship. I met bibliographers who came to the conference to share news about the Middle Eastern collections in their libraries, in addition to catalogers, collection development librarians, and book vendors. In the conference, I attended a presentation about book fairs in some Arab countries, and another presentation about a very rich blog about Middle Eastern collection named AMIR. I spent the other four days attending different MESA presentations, such as: “Preserving Endangered collections: The Yemeni Manuscript Digitization Initiative,” “The Anthropology of Berber Societies: New Approaches to Space, Time, and History,” “Bridging the Gap between FuSHaa and the Arabic Dialects in the Teaching of Arabic as a Foreign Language,” and “Internationalization and Privatization of Higher Education in the Arab World—Challenges and Chances.”

The MESA presentations were very informative and interesting to the extent that you wish you could attend all of them, which occur all at the same time, without exception. It was very useful for me to attend several presentations in order to learn from presenters the art of sharing an enthusiasm about a topic and the professionalism in keeping audiences interested in the presentations until the end in order to ask questions and give comments.

The MELA and MESA conferences are the bridges enabling library science students to connect with the world of professional Middle East and North African librarians. Participating in the George Atiyeh competition while studying provides an LIS student with an idea about where to search for a professional job after graduation and whom to contact for advice. It was a great experience and I invite all
library science students interested in the MENA region to participate in the competition or attend those conferences. Finally, I would like to extend my thanks to the George Atiyeh committee members, Mr. Sean Swanick, Mr. Ali Houissa, and Ms. Anaïs Salamon, for offering me this opportunity, and to all members of MELA for their warm welcome and valued advice.

MINUTES
President Michael Hopper called the meeting to order just after 9:00 am. He thanked this year’s corporate sponsors, which included Brill, Dar al-Mandumah, Eastview, IranFarhang, Leila Books, Libra Books, and Gerlach Books.

The minutes from the 2010 business meeting were approved.

OFFICER REPORTS
PRESIDENT’S REPORT:
Michael Hopper thanked V.P. David Hirsch for his efforts putting together this year’s meeting.

VICE-PRESIDENT’S REPORT:
David Hirsch gave thanks to Liz O’Brien of the Smithsonian Institute for all her assistance in arranging for the MELA meeting to
be held in the Museum and for subsidizing a good portion of its costs. He also thanked Michael Hopper, William Kopycki, and Patrick Visel for their help in planning and organizing the meeting, a challenging feat since everyone was residing outside the metro D.C. area. He welcomed feedback on this year’s meeting so as to help for next year.

SECRETARY-TREASURER’S REPORT:
[The treasury statement is appended to these minutes.] He added that there are funds available for next year if committees have ideas for activities requiring funding.

MELA NOTES EDITOR’S REPORT:
[The full text of the report is appended to these minutes.] Issue number 84 for 2010/2011 will be published this next year, appearing in print as well as appearing on the MELA website. Book reviews will appear on the website before they appear in the print journal; a workflow is being established to streamline the process. This new issue of MELA Notes will have a lengthy article by the late Omar Khalidi. Last year the entire backfile of MELA Notes was sent to JSTOR for digitization; this was thanks to the contributions of Elizabeth Vernon, Jonathan Rodgers, and John Eilts. The print copies will also be kept in a “dark archive” with JSTOR. Scanning has been halfway completed. The complete run of MELA Notes should appear on JSTOR in 6–8 months.

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR’S REPORT:
Rachel Simon reminded everyone that book reviews should be turned in within six months; considering that some journals require a two-month turnaround time, six months is very generous. She said that posting book reviews online is good not only for the publishers, but also good for the reviewers—especially those who are required to write such reviews for promotion and tenure. She thanked all who have been turning their reviews in on time and looks forward to receiving more completed reviews in the future.

WEBMASTER’S REPORT:
Patrick Visel reported that he has been working “behind the scenes” to organize the website using a content management system. He noted that the Committees section of the website is the most problematic as some committees would like to be able to update and
add their own content. Several job positions have been posted on the website as well as updates to the MELA Notes section of the site with newly-scanned issues. The MELA Notepad blog has been static. He asked members to please contribute items of interest to the blog, and added that newly-received book reviews will appear there.

**COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**COMMITTEE ON CATALOGING:** Iman Dagher reported on behalf of Mark Muehlhaeusler, committee chair. The committee met several times over the past year via Skype, where they discussed the “best practices for Arabic script” document. There were different opinions on this issue as some areas of the committee’s document conflicted with the PCC practices. The Committee will ask PCC to establish a subcommittee to look at these issues. An online survey was put out to membership regarding RDA planning in their libraries. Thirty replies have been received so far. Iman welcomed additional feedback from members on this topic.

**EDUCATION COMMITTEE:** Ali Boutaqmanti (Chair) reported that the syllabus for the WISE program with Simmons College is still being developed. A target date of summer 2012 has been set. Simmons still needs to review the curriculum and the proposed instructor, Shayee Khanaka. While designing the syllabus, Ali noticed the lack of a single comprehensive textbook on Middle East librarianship that might be used in such a course. As such, he asked members to suggest individual articles and readings for inclusion; these could be channeled into an online resource center to help support the course.

As for the MELA mentorship program, he stated that there were four participants last year. The program was extended from 12 to 18 months to meet the demand and interest. The committee sent a survey to the participants and the feedback was very positive. This past year there was only one mentor and one advisee. Ali asked those interested to please contact him for participation.

Last year the committee held an online session of the SACO training program. The instructor, Paul Frank of the Library of Congress, recommended that any in-depth session be done on-site rather than online. The session will take place during lunch today.

Ali asked about the University of North Carolina program for educating librarians in the Middle East. Amanda Click, a student in this program, said that she and her colleagues from the program are attending MELA/MESA and would like to meet with interested
MELA members to help form partnerships. A meeting on UNC’s program will be held at the Marriott on December 1.

COMMITTEE FOR IRAQI LIBRARIES: Jeff Spurr (Chair) spoke about the status of Iraqi libraries and archives. [A full version of this report will appear in MELA Notes]

MELA-specific highlights of the report:

- The committee produced a draft questionnaire to be used towards systematic review of Iraqi libraries. The review was designed to elicit such information for the libraries of each university or institution of higher learning in Iraq, with the aim of addressing basic issues of staffing, collections, equipment, and systems.
- Falah Rashid produced a survey of the resources and staffing of libraries in agricultural colleges in Iraq (Baghdad, Basra, Mosul, Anbar, Tikrit, and Kufa). He also wrote a report on the staffs of the central libraries, broken down by specialties and indicating their levels of educational attainment, ranging from doctorates all the way down to “reads and writes.”
- Jeff presented a talk, “On Seized Iraqi Documents and the Right of Possession,” at a conference, Human Rights and Cultural Heritage: From the Holocaust to the Haitian Earthquake, at the Benjamin Cardozo School of Law, Yeshiva University, on 31 March 2011. In this paper he discussed the issues surrounding the documents taken from the Iraq National Library and Archives, including those taken by the U.S. military; those appropriated by the Iraq Memory Foundation (IMF) and now residing in the Hoover Institution, Stanford University, since 2008; and the Iraqi Jewish Archive, still warehoused with the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA).

Hirad Dinavari asked if efforts were being made by the Iraq National Library and Archives to collect publications in all languages, including Kurdish, Aramaic, and others. Jeff replied that Saad Eskandar now has the capacity to acquire publications from all provinces in the country, including the Kurdish region.

Anchi Hoh asked if the survey for Iraqi libraries will be shared with the group, and if so, what the timeline is for this. Jeff answered that Falah only began this work this fall. He envisioned that results
would be made incrementally on the MELA website, but the survey process would likely take three to four years to complete.

**NOMINATING COMMITTEE:** Committee Chair David Giovacchini reported that the initial call for officer nominations received little response at first, but as he and Shayee worked, they were able to produce a good roster of candidates. E-voting went according to the timeline as planned. David thanked Iman Dagher for her work setting up the electronic voting process using BallotBin. She also coordinated with William Kopycki to ensure that all paid-up members were able to vote. Of the eligible voters, 65 percent actually cast votes; this is in line with last year’s response rate, which was 69 percent.

The newly-elected officers include:

- **Vice-President/Program Chair/President-Elect:** Christof Galli (Duke)
- **Member-at-Large:** Sharon Smith (MIT)

**GEORGE ATIYEH PRIZE COMMITTEE:** Anaïs Salamon gave the report on behalf of Sean Swanick, chair of the committee. This year there were two winners of the Atiyeh Prize: Latifa Baali, a student Queens College (CUNY) and bibliographic assistant at Columbia University Library; and Amada Click, a Ph.D. student at the University of North Carolina. The winners expressed their appreciation to MELA for this prize and the chance to meet everyone in person.

**DAVID H. PARTINGTON AWARD COMMITTEE:** John Eilts reported that this year’s winner was Fawzi Khoury. Mr. Khoury began his career at the University of Washington Libraries in 1967, when the library had only a modest collection on the Near East. He quickly began to expand the coverage in keeping pace with the growing program of teaching at the University of Washington. Mr. Khoury’s service to the profession is an equally impressive record. Within MELA he served in various positions, including President, Vice President, and more importantly as Editor of *MELA Notes*. It was during this time that *MELA Notes* evolved from a newsletter to a serious journal in the field of Middle East librarianship. Mr. Khoury worked to make it a more professional-looking publication as well as publishing quality articles. Among his other accomplishments were the editing and publishing of two important works in the field: *National Union*

John reported that Fawzy’s health condition prevented him from attending the meeting, but that he was here in spirit. John announced that an endowed book fund is being opened by the University of Washington in Fawzy’s name; information about this will be posted on MELANET.

**OTHER REPORTS**

*MELCOM:* Peter Magierski gave an update about MELCOM, whose May 2011 conference was held at the Staatsbibliothek in Berlin. Several presentations dealt with digitization efforts in Europe of Middle Eastern manuscripts. Next year’s conference will be held in Paris.

*MEMP:* Shayee Khanaka (Chair) presented the report. The Turkish newspapers project, taken from CRL’s collection, has finally been completed. The Berkeley Iraqi Newspaper project, including runs of *al-Da’wah, al-Zaman, al-Bayyinah al-Jadidah, al-Huda,* and *al-Fath al-Mubin,* have been completed. Newly-approved projects include *Yas Turkistan.* Although HathiTrust is digitizing this newspaper, its open access was questioned. Ultimately, the board agreed to film this title for the benefit of MEMP members. Other projects include the continued filming of *Kayhan* (London), *Tahrir* (Cairo), a new post-revolution newspaper, will also be filmed. As for digital projects, the newspapers *Qenneshrin* (Sweden) and *Muntada* (London) will be digitized. These newspapers were chosen in particular on the basis that these were smaller newspapers held by only one or two libraries. Digitization represents a new direction for MEMP. Shayee encouraged members to make proposals for North African newspapers, as there are very few newspapers from that region in the MEMP collection. Finally, the board discussed ways to attract new members, noting that budget cuts in institutions make MEMP an attractive opportunity for access to materials. John Eilts will be heading a task force to examine this issue.

*AMEEL:* Elizabeth Beaudin presented an update on the project and on Yale Library. Susan Gibbons started as University Librarian in July. Ann Okerson has left Yale to work with CRL as senior advisor on electronic strategies. Ellen Hammond now leads the newly-
established International Collections and Research Support Group, under which the Near Eastern Section now falls. Abdul Ahad Hannawi and Majda Deeb continue their positions in the section, while the search to fill Simon Samoeil’s position is now underway. As for AMEEL, the project has added more full-text content. However, in May the Department of Education cut its TICFIA program, which AMEEL had relied on to bring content from the Middle East to make it accessible to U.S. scholars here. As a result, AMEEL has lost its funding for the next two years. Despite this, 16,000 pages of searchable text has been added thanks to a joint program with SOAS at the University of London. This project also included digitized manuscripts from Yale’s Medical Historical Library, among these a copy of al-Qanun fi al-Tibb. Additional content includes a series of dictionaries, extracts from the Encyclopaedia of Islam 3, and official gazettes from Syria and Palestine. Another project includes Arcadia funding for two staff to describe the contents of 1,400 audio tapes, mostly of fundamentalist content. Descriptions of the tapes will be in Arabic and English. Initial descriptions of tapes featuring Osama bin Laden’s voice or references to him have been released, but due to copyright restrictions interested scholars will have to make arrangements to hear the audio. Regarding the OASIS project, new security features have been added following the servers being hacked. Partners are reminded to continue sending their updates of serials holdings, changing to twice a year instead of quarterly. A survey will be sent to all MELA members before any additional changes are made.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS, MIDDLE EAST SECTION: Paul Crego gave this year’s report for the Middle East Section. He indicated that this year the section has had to “do more with less,” noting that since Sara Ozturk’s retirement in July 2010, the section has not had a permanent head. During FY2011, serials cataloger Hoda Fateen retired. Two other staff members transferred to other divisions, leaving the section with eight people, including: Michael Chyet (Kurdish; plus Arabic, Persian, Turkish), Paul Crego (Armenian and Georgian), Khalil Foutah (Arabic), Eman Wassef (Arabic), Allen Maberry (Arabic, Turkish, Islamic Law), Zoya Nizari (Turkish, Azeri, and Turkic languages of Central Asia), Marzieh Rafi (technician), and Hussein Younossei (technician). The section continued to receive Armeno-Turkish books as well as some Karamanli titles over the past year. The section received a number of
rare Coptic and other Christian materials in Arabic. They also received 350 items from the National Library of Iran, 320 Persian folkloric cassettes from the Persian Community of Los Angeles, and a number of Baha’i books. More materials in Syriac and neo-Aramaic are also arriving to be processed. Paul added that in Georgia, work is being done to create an online catalog through the Parliament. This will enable collection development specialists to gain better insight into what has been published there. A list of new section-specific subject headings established by LC will be distributed electronically. Among the most interesting/amusing headings established this past year was “Bush, George W. (George Walker), 1946---Shoe Incident, 2008.”

**UPDATE ON SUBCOMMITTEE FOR SYRIAC ROMANIZATION:** Joan Biella gave the update. A draft was presented to the Library of Congress, largely through the work of J.F. Coakley (Cambridge), along with Meryle Gaston, Michael Hopper, Joan Biella, and Michael Chyet. This was one table only, as opposed to other proposals for classical vs. modern, or Eastern vs. Western Syriac. This was on the basis that there are so few libraries using LC/ALA Romanization tables with the capacity to know one version of Syriac, let alone all. The current table has been posted to MELANET for comment, with the 90-day period extending to include ALA Midwinter, where the ALCTS/CC:AAM committee will review it with their pool of experts. Joan added that improvements to the Persian Romanization table submitted by Hirad Dinavari and Michael Chyet have been submitted to CC:AAM for review and comment.

**LIBRARY OF CONGRESS, NEAR EAST SECTION:** Chris Murphy presented highlights from the section’s activities over the past year. Ibrahim Pourhadi retired after 57 years of service. The section has three vacancies: one technician, an Iranian specialist, and a Turkish/Central Asian specialist. Major outreach activities included a concert of Kazakh music, a celebration of Nowruz, an international symposium on Ameen Rihani, and a symposium on the literature and performing arts of Turkmenistan.

Sectional staff worked with individual offices of members of Congress to assist with reference requests. Staff also worked with the Department of Defense and State Department, particularly in the area of digitizing documents and holdings of the Afghanistan Media Resource Center concerning the Mujahidin-Soviet war.
Hirad Dinavari (along with Michael Chyet) produced a report on Kurdish holdings of the Library, its strengths and weaknesses.

The section received approximately 14,000 bound volumes over the past year, while another 5,000 volumes are sent to Ft. Meade. The section now holds 480,000 bound volumes, one half of which are in Arabic, with 75,000 each in Turkish and Persian and the other 90,000 in 36 different languages, the fewest being in Ingush, of which the Library holds 12.

In the past 12 months the section has sent 480,000 images to be microfilmed and it has received an additional 637 reels of microfilm from New Delhi. These are all newspapers in the section’s languages.

The staff has continued to work with the World Digital Library.

Muhannad Salhi has been working hard to document the “Arab Spring” online through the Library’s cooperation with the Internet Archive, sending 48,000 URLs to be archived. While many of these are “one-time” captures, there are many blogs and political party sites that are being crawled on a regular basis.

Despite budget woes, the section was able to acquire a number of significant items for the Library’s collections, notably 4 Chagatay manuscripts, including a Divan of Baba Rahim Mashrab (18th/19th-century Uzbek poet) and a commentary on that divan. The section also acquired the books and papers of Muhammed Tahir, the Palestinian journalist and intellectual; 13 Palestinian films and documentaries; 78 Persian titles on the Bahai; 104 titles on the Druze; and the first Armenian Book published in Russia (1819 in Moscow).

Forthcoming is an exhibit of Armenian treasures from LC’s collections to celebrate the 500th anniversary of the first movable type printing for Armenian. A book on the Armenian collection at LC will be published. An international symposium on Jurji Zaydan will also be held. Chris reminded everyone that all such events are recorded and presented as webcasts, freely available to the public online.

The budget situation looks extremely bad for the future at the Library. The section has already cut back by 20% the number of reels of microfilm it received from New Delhi. The section expects no ability to hire new staff. Currently 4 of the 8 members of the section are retirement eligible, and as they retire the section will be able to do less and less.
Someone asked how the Library could purchase the Chagatay manuscripts without violating cultural patrimony laws. Chris answered that the seller was given the manuscripts from the Uzbek minister of culture along with a letter authorizing their sale. He added that the Library is very conscientious in following such laws.

**New Business**

Michael Hopper began going over the existing MELA committees and accepting nominations for members to serve. After discussion about each, the committees, along with their charges, were established as follows:

**A†IYEH COMMITTEE**: Karl Schaefer, Anchi Hoh, Anaïs Salamon. **Charge**: to review the Atiyeh award, reconcile differences on website versus by-laws, and make recommendations. This committee will work in conjunction with the Awards Committee.

**AWARDS COMMITTEE**: William Kopycki, John Eilts, and Akram Khabibullæev. **Charge**: to review all awards present and planned and recommend guidelines for future awards, memorials, etc.

**COMMITTEES WORKING GROUP**: Rebecca Routh, Nora Avetyan, Nawal Kawar, [need two other members]. **Charge**: to review all committees, their composition, procedures for electing chairs, etc., and make recommendations.

**WEBSITE COMMITTEE**: Patrick Visel, Mark Muehlhaeusler, and Anaïs Salamon. **Charge**: to make recommendations on redesign of the MELA website.

**BYLAWS COMMITTEE**: Patrick Visel, Nawal Kawar, David Giovacchini. **Charge**: to review bylaws, especially in regard to the term of president and other officers and the introduction and approval of amendments electronically at any time.

**STATISTICS**: Anchi Hoh, Michael Hopper, and Robin Dougherty. **Charge**: to investigate putting up member statistics similar to CEAL.

**OTHER NEW BUSINESS**

Mohammed Abou el-Seoud asked if MELA would consider having a space on its website where it could host materials collected on the
Arab Spring. Michael said that this is something the Website Committee would look at.

Mohammed asked if it would be possible to have an introductory session, prior to the start of the meeting, for first-time attendees to orient them to MELA and its activities. William Kopycki replied that when he receives such requests, he directs the inquirer to the MELA website and especially the back-issues of *MELA Notes*, where the minutes of previous meetings are held. Because MELA annual meeting activities are very compressed and time is at a premium, it is hard to schedule a “pre-meeting” meeting to accommodate this. David Hirsch suggested that new members be referred to the mentorship committee; Ali Boutaqmanti agreed with this. Michael said the Executive Board would look at this.

Mohammed also asked about outsourcing for Middle East cataloging. Michael suggested that this type of discussion take place on the Middle East Vendors mailing list. This is a private mailing list (not affiliated with MELA) open to non-vendors only. For more information, contact John Eilts at Stanford.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Hardcopies of the Cataloging Committee-issued RDA Survey were distributed; this is addition to the electronic survey. Results of the survey will be tabulated and released soon. About 30 libraries have responded to date.

Ali Bakr Hassan announced that his book, an edition of al-Makin Jirjis al-ʿAmid’s *Tarikh al-Makin* (Cairo, 2010), has been published. He has also published *From George Washington to George Bush* (vol. 1, published in Cairo) and a compilation of early Arab immigrants’ poems (published in Damascus).

Robin Dougherty distributed a pamphlet from a distributor of Palestinian goods, including DVDs from Palestine that have institutional viewing rights. She also mentioned she would be giving a paper on cultural expressiveness during the Arab revolutions, taking place on Sunday at 8:30 a.m.

Rachel Simon, speaking on behalf of Joyce Bell, announced that a number of manuscripts from two private libraries in Yemen have been digitized; these are now available on Princeton Library’s website. The digitization was done by the Imam Zayd ibn Ali Foundation in Yemen, with metadata and conversion done by Princeton’s digital library staff. Additional manuscripts will be added over the next year.
Michael thanked Liz O’Brien and all the staff of the Smithsonian for their help in hosting this meeting. The meeting adjourned shortly after 12:00 noon.

Respectfully submitted,

William Kopycki
Secretary-Treasurer
Secretary-Treasurer’s Report
As of November 27, 2011

INCOME

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dues, subscriptions, meeting registration</td>
<td>$9,609.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mailing list rental</td>
<td>195.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilkins Fund contributions</td>
<td>97.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vendor contributions</td>
<td>2,539.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank interest</td>
<td>5.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL INCOME</strong></td>
<td><strong>$12,446.39</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EXPENSES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MELA Meeting expenses 2010</td>
<td>$3,705.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MELA Meeting expenses 2011</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MELA Notes #83 printing and mailing</td>
<td>854.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atiyeh Award</td>
<td>600.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partington award</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL EXPENSES</strong></td>
<td><strong>$5,560.26</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PNC Bank Checking account balance as of November 27, 2011 $42,569.09
PNC Bank Savings account balance as of November 27, 2011 5,436.01

**TOTAL $48,005.10**

Wilkins Fund to date [($15,552.02)]

As of November 27, 2011, MELA’s members were 87 total, with 66 members paid up through 2011, and 62 paid up through 2012. There were 22 new members added to the MELA registry since November 2010.

As of November 27, 2011, we have 10 library subscriptions to *MELA Notes*, with 4 subscriptions being handled through vendors.

Respectfully submitted,

William J. Kopycki
Secretary-Treasurer
Editor’s Report, November 2011

During the year 2010–11, one annual issue of *MELA Notes*, number 84 (2011), will be published in print and will be distributed to the membership and subscribers. The issue will appear electronically at http://www.mela.us/MELANotes/MELA-Notes.html.

The current issue will consist of the following items:

- “A Guide to Arabic, Persian, Turkish, and Urdu Manuscript Libraries in India,” by Omar Khalidi, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
- “Middle Eastern Film Round-Up, Fall–Winter 2009/2010,” by David Giovacchini, Stanford University
- 10 Book Reviews
- Books Received for Review 2010–11
- MELA Business Meeting 2010 Minutes and Reports

The book reviews which will be published in this issue have been submitted to the webmaster for posting prior to publication, and I plan to continue submitting them on a rolling basis as received and edited.

The upcoming issue will be taken up in large part by a lengthy article submitted to me in August 2010 by our late lamented colleague Omar Khalidi, shortly before his tragic death. Omar had mentioned that he still wanted to tweak it a bit, but sadly he did not have the opportunity to do so. Therefore I am publishing the article as I received it at the time.

Last year, we initiated the process of supplying our entire backfile of *MELA Notes* to JSTOR for digitization and inclusion in their database. This will significantly increase our visibility and make *MELA Notes* available to a much wider audience. With the generous assistance of our members Elizabeth Vernon, Jonathan Rodgers, and John Eilts, we were able to assemble a complete backfile of issues which we donated permanently to JSTOR. In addition to scanning them, JSTOR will keep all the paper copies in a dark paper repository facility they maintain. This provides an extra measure of safety to preserve the original material, and also allows for the possibility that the material might need to be scanned again in the future as scanning technology rapidly evolves. I was recently
notified that *MELA Notes* is at the halfway point of the release process. It is currently at the vendor undergoing the digitization process. When JSTOR receives the dataset files, it will have to undergo quality control testing and data processing before release. For most titles at this stage, JSTOR anticipates a target release date of six to eight months.

I am extremely grateful for the assistance of my colleagues Jonathan Rodgers, immediate past editor of *MELA Notes*, our book review editor, Rachel Simon, our webmaster, Patrick Visel, and our secretary-treasurer, William Kopycki.

As always, I urge the membership to submit articles and to encourage colleagues to do so.

Respectfully submitted,

Marlis J. Saleh, Editor